Evaluation Report 1989

UNEP

United Nations Environment Programme

best copy available

Nairobi 1989

EVALUATION REPORT
1989

Report of the Executive Director

Contents

		Page
	INTRODUCTION	4
I.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
	A. Substantive and programmatic issues	5
	B. Managerial and administrative issues	5
II.	SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PROJECTS	13
	Combating desertification through integrated agricultural development in the Lodar Area of the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen	13
	UNEP support to the implementation of the South Pacific Regional Environment Programme (SPREP)	18
	Monitoring of pollution in the marine environment of the West and Central African Region (WACAF)	24
	Continuing support to National Focal Points for the integration of environmental components into curricula of business schools: two environmental management training seminars	29
	Survey of the state of the world lakes	34
	Network of Industrial Environmental Management (NIEM)	36
III.	SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF EDUCATION, PUBLIC AWARENESS AND INFORMATION PROJECTS	39
	International Environmental Education Programme (IEEP)	39
	Directories of marine science institutes and bibliographies of marine pollution	44
	Support to the Television Trust for the Environment (TVE)	49
	Environment and Military Activity - Phase II: "Cultural Norms in Relation to War and The Environment"	54
	Support to the Production of the World Resources Report 1989 (Vol.3)	58
	INFOTERRA Programme Activity Centre - Phase II : "Man and The Atmosphere: Climate change, Ozone Layer"	61
	Journalistic Attachment Programme	65

/...

Page

IV. SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF PROJECTS SUPPORTING NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS 67

Information Services to the NGO Community 67

Support to African NGOs Network to Combat Desertification: "Environmental Rehabilitation of Four Villages in the Kweneng District, Botswana" 73

/...

INTRODUCTION

The present Evaluation Report 1989 contains the findings of selected evaluations of projects that deal with environmental management, education, public awareness and information, as well as projects that support non-governmental organizations. In addition to these examples, the executive summary includes the findings of all the evaluations completed by UNEP between the last quarter of 1988 and the second quarter of 1989. The actions that UNEP intends to take in the future are based on the findings of all the evaluations.

UNEP evaluations are carried out at three levels of depth, with corresponding formats:

In-depth evaluations, which analyze project performance thoroughly and are conducted by external evaluators who base their findings on documentary sources, site visits and searches (questionnaires);

Desk evaluations, which also analyze project performance, but are less detailed and are carried out by internal evaluators on the basis of documentation and searches; and

Project manager's evaluations, which address only the attainment of project objectives, are much briefer than the others and are carried out by the officers in charge of the project on the basis of their own experience and information. The format in which the sample evaluations are presented shows some variations, due to the introduction, in 1988, of the new guidelines for project evaluation developed by the secretariat. In future, all evaluations will be conducted as far as possible according to these guidelines, thereby ensuring compatibility of results and greater uniformity of presentation.

The Executive Director hopes that the findings and recommendations derived from these evaluations will help shape policy further and thereby guide future programme and project development. However, it should be borne in mind that some of the recommendations included in this report require financial and human resources beyond those currently available to UNEP and can be fulfilled only when such resources become available.

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This section contains a synthesis of the findings of the sample evaluations presented in this report, as well as of other evaluations carried out during the period it covers.

The findings are accompanied by the lessons that can be derived from them, as well as by the actions that UNEP intends to take on this basis. Actions that have policy implications are highlighted.

The material is presented in the following sections:

1. Substantive and programmatic issues

   (a) General approach to the development of the programme;

   (b) Environmental management;

   (c) Education and training;

   (d) Public awareness and information.

2. Managerial and administrative issues

   (a) Project cycle;

   (b) Relations between UNEP and its partners.

1. SUBSTANTIVE AND PROGRAMMATIC ISSUES

GENERAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROGRAMME

FINDINGS

When UNEP has promoted an original idea or programme approach in respect of environmental issues and then stepped back from the actual implementation, letting technically proficient organizations develop an initiative independently, there has been considerable success. A case that illustrates this clearly is the support UNEP has given to the Television Trust for the Environment (TVE).

In cases where UNEP has given attention to building a strong institutional structure, within which actions can be developed in a long-term perspective, results have been very positive.

In those cases where UNEP has placed a strong emphasis on mobilizing Governments, institutions and people to support projects or programmes and eventually taken charge of them, the best results have been obtained. A clear example of this are various UNEP initiatives concerning the marine environment.

LESSONS LEARNED

UNEP's catalytic influence can be most effective when emphasis is put on providing intellectual leadership and inspiration, together with the necessary practical support to give the initial impetus for environmental actions that would otherwise not take place.

Programmes can develop best when attention is focused on providing a firm institutional basis and fostering local participation at all levels, so that users can take responsibility for the actions and thus make them their own.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

UNEP will emphasize the provision of intellectual leadership when playing its catalytic role. In terms of providing practical support UNEP will stress setting processes in motion, but will refrain for the most part from controlling operations, acting as a facilitator rather than executor.

UNEP will ensure that appropriate institutional structures to support programme development exist. If they do not, the necessary steps either to encourage or support them directly their development will be taken before other action is initiated.

UNEP will involve Governments, local institutions and people in all aspects of a project as appropriate, placing the stakes and responsibility for the project in the hands of the users while giving substantive guidance in accordance to its mandate.

ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT

FINDINGS

Some UNEP environmental management projects have placed a high value on sophisticated technical or engineering solutions. A case in point is some support given by UNEP to combat desertification through agricultural development. Governments often favour these solutions because they are seen as prestigious, and UNEP has complied with these desires. Initially, because of the enthusiasm generated, this approach has sometimes worked. In the long term, however, it has created dependence on external support and resources, which has been impossible to maintain and repeat.

In some projects dealing with technical aspects of environmental management - for example, of the type undertaken in mountain regions to rehabilitate degraded environments - there has not always been a conscious resolve to record systematically and preserve the experience gained during project implementation, particularly in terms of social and cultural interactions. Thus, when similar projects elsewhere are undertaken, the cycle of experimentation on how to motivate local populations must be started again. (Note: this finding is common to projects of other bodies and agencies).

LESSONS LEARNED

Overly sophisticated technical solutions may create dependency on outside support, and will have a tendency not to be cost-effective or amenable to sustaining over time.

Many of the factors that condition the success of a project go well beyond its purely technical aspects. Unless an effort is made to record other aspects of the project experience, it may not be possible to replicate them in the future.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

As a policy matter, UNEP will stress the desirability of fostering local self-reliance within a framework of cost-effective and replicable approaches. As a matter of principle, simple and inexpensive interventions, which correspond to local technical capabilities, will be preferred.

UNEP will require that project experience be formally recorded and, where possible, distilled in the form of guidelines, manuals and other appropriate means. These records will contain not only technical material as they do at present, but also a description of the project experience in terms of institutional, managerial, financial and other aspects which might provide insights into projects in similar conditions. The UNEP Manual on the Design, Approval and Evaluation of Projects will be amended to accommodate this.

EDUCATION AND TRAINING

FINDINGS

The environmental education activities of UNEP have had the greatest impact when they were undertaken within the framework of national education policies and strategies, as in the case of some IEEP activities.

Some environmental training activities of UNEP have not had a pronounced impact, mainly because of their ad hoc nature and diffusion in numerous subjects.

The selection of trainees in UNEP-supported training projects still needs improvement, in spite of considerable efforts on the part of UNEP during the past few years. This is particularly true in respect of specialized courses. Some of the trainees still do not possess either the background necessary to profit from the course, nor are they placed in positions in which they can apply their newly learned skills after the training.

In some instances, course content has not been tailored to local needs. In a significant number of cases, trainees have stated that insufficient attention is given to dealing with issues relevant to developing countries.

LESSONS LEARNED

If environmental education activities are to have the greatest possible impact, they must be undertaken within the framework of national education policies and strategies.

Training activities can have a greater impact if they take place in the context of a well-structured programme and concentrate on only a few issues.

The appropriate selection of trainees is one of the determining factors in the eventual impact of the courses.

Course content can be significantly improved if there is concentration on fewer issues, particularly those that are relevant locally, and that can be expanded by increments as experience develops.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

UNEP will not normally undertake any environmental education activities outside the framework of the International Environmental Education Programme (IEEP) and will urge Unesco, its partner in the programme, to place more emphasis on influencing national education policies and strategies so as to provide a receptive framework for environmental education activities.

UNEP will develop a more stringent training policy and a better-structured training programme to support priority action areas in the field of environment.

UNEP will further refine criteria for the selection of trainees and will solicit the active support and co-operation of Governments in making more appropriate choices.

UNEP will ensure that course contents are better suited to the needs of recipients, and in particular, of developing countries. To this end it will: (i) concentrate on fewer issues, primarily those subjects which fall within the priority areas of UNEP; (ii) build up a series of case study materials relevant to different regional (and national) concerns; and (iii) adapt the curricula in accordance with experience in each course.

PUBLIC AWARENESS AND INFORMATION

FINDINGS

UNEP has often tended to rely too heavily on the printed word, rather than to take advantage of the broadening range of technological developments in information. While the printed word is often appropriate, it has resulted in reduced impact in other instances. This is apparent in some of the data systems that UNEP maintains mainly through directories.

Problems still exist in the distribution of publications, particularly specialized ones, in spite of UNEP's continuous efforts to improve. The right audiences have not always been reached, either because they were not identified correctly or because publications were not produced in the appropriate form - as in the case of some of the technical publications issued as popular books. By contrast, UNEP has been more successful in reaching the news media. The topicality of environmental matters ensures interest, particularly for those issues with which the public can associate itself. However, apart from the UNEP work to protect the ozone layer and its investigations of climate change, the media carry little information on other United Nations work to safeguard the environment.

Some UNEP reports dealing with current topics were prepared in haste, were not always accurate and would have benefited from more up-to-date information.

LESSONS LEARNED

Two important factors in the success of public awareness and information campaigns are (i) the tailoring of both the message and the medium to a carefully identified audience and (ii) concentrating on those elements of environmental deterioration with which the public can associate itself.

The usefulness of awareness creating material appears to be directly proportional to the quality of the information, the topicality of the subject and its treatment.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

UNEP will use a variety of media and formats and exploit a greater variety of presentations, concentrating on those topics with which the public can identify.

UNEP will develop a three-fold strategy for the production and distribution of awareness and information material by: (i) developing more accurate and updated distribution lists, trying to identify all the possible audiences for a particular issue (professional help to do this will be sought from other agencies, professional associations and governments); (ii) developing a variety of products from basic material tailored to the specific needs and interests of different audiences, including policy makers, scientists and technicians and the general public; (iii) becoming part of the world-wide electronic mail system.

UNEP will stress quality when preparing public awareness or information material, opting for either producing original material, or finding ways of bringing together dispersed material available elsewhere and making it accessible to wider audiences. This will include information on UN action.

2. MANAGERIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE ISSUES

PROJECT CYCLE

FINDINGS

The 'umbrella' concept of project design has proved very useful in a number of cases because it minimizes administrative action. In this type of project, subprojects detailing self-contained actions can simply be appended to the main body of a project document, in which the overall strategy is described; it is therefore unnecessary to alter the entire project document.

In spite of recent methodological improvements, some aspects of project design remain problematic. The major obstacle to planning concerns project duration; invariably the time necessary to carry out all the activities is much longer than that initially conceived. Delays in project implementation - hiring staff and delivery of equipment, for example - are subject to long delays in many cases. While some of the causes are beyond UNEP's control, others can be ascribed to UNEP's lack of operational capacity, particularly in respect of the administration of field projects.

In many cases, it has proved difficult to evaluate the impact of UNEP projects. There are insufficient records of project implementation because monitoring is limited to project management and does not cover impact. Some evaluation methods - such as questionnaires and desk analysis - do not provide the full extent of information necessary. This situation - dictated by reasons of economy - exists in a high proportion of UNEP endeavours.

LESSONS LEARNED

Project design has been confirmed as an important aspect of the project cycle, influencing project management, and, more important, the eventual impact of the project.

The impact of projects can be increased only if the mechanisms critical to this positive impact are isolated, studied and replicated.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

UNEP will extend the use of the 'umbrella' project design concept. Where this is not feasible, UNEP will adapt those of its elements that allow for a more flexible implementation, i.e. allowing for partial modifications without affecting the basic assumptions of the project. In this connection, UNEP will take greater care to state the project assumptions as explicitly as possible - for example, the expected duration - as well as endeavour to be more realistic in gauging field conditions.

UNEP will continue to improve its project monitoring and evaluation procedures as far as possible, considering budget constraints. At the same time, additional funds will be included in some project budgets, on an experimental basis, for impact monitoring and evaluation.

RELATIONS BETWEEN UNEP AND ITS PARTNERS

FINDINGS

UNEP has tended, particularly in its collaboration with other bodies of the United Nations system, to try to exert too close a control on its partners, asking to review all their actions and expending much effort on attempts to control administration of projects. This has slowed progress and dampened the enthusiasm of the associates and their respect for UNEP's contribution.

LESSONS LEARNED

UNEP has obtained its best results in co-ordination when collaborative relations are based on the development of ideas and strengthening of established systems by introducing a more strongly environmental perspective, while at the same time minimizing administrative controls on the partners.

ACTIONS THAT UNEP INTENDS TO TAKE

UNEP will henceforth develop its collaboration with partners along general substantive lines agreed in principle, stressing co-ordination and reducing the need for continued managerial communication and checks of an administrative nature. To ensure this, the standard clauses inserted by UNEP in future project documents will be amended by amending the UNEP Manual for Design and Project Approval.

UNEP will make it a matter of policy to build upon and improve existing well established systems by introducing environmental or other specific contributions, rather than creating new and often weaker-systems.

II. SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PROJECTS

In-depth Evaluation

Title: COMBATING DESERTIFICATION THROUGH INTEGRATED AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT IN LODAR AREA, PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF YEMEN FP/CP/1700-82-06 (2322) and FP/CP/6201-82-06 (2322)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Ministry of Agriculture, Government of the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen

Scope: National

Duration: October 1983 - June 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US $	%
To UNEP (cash)	936,406	47
To UNEP (in kind)	35,206	2
AGFUND	400,000	21
Government of PDR Yemen	568,000	30
Total	1,939,612	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) Establishment of an agro-forestry complex as a wide-range pilot project to be duplicated in other areas, comprising the following physical cropping patterns: citrus: 70 ha, vegetables: 60 ha, field and fodder crops: 110 ha, afforestation: 150 ha;

(ii) Introducing and testing under the local conditions techniques of agricultural cropping, including soil tillage, application of fertilizers and pesticides, irrigation (surface sprinkler and drip) with the overall objective that these would become models for further and extended use by farmers all over the country;

(iii) Introduction in the area of high value horticultural crops and improved varieties which will help compensate for deficiencies of fruits, vegetables and other food products;

(iv) Provision of necessary measures against wind and water erosion, including establishment of wind-breaks and shelterbelts;

/...

(v) Establishment of productive plantations to satisfy fuel and small size construction wood requirements of the local population;

(vi) Establishment of two protected areas, 100 ha each, for testing and demonstrating rangeland improvement treatments.

Long-term objectives

(i) Better use and management of water resources, with due emphasis on maintaining well-water salinity at the lowest possible level by avoiding over-pumping;

(ii) Improvement of soil properties for better production, control of soil salinity through improved irrigation-farming systems;

(iii) Creating more job opportunities and increasing incomes in the rural areas through stabilization of agriculture; creating variation in production resources, introduction of better farm management and production of high value crops;

(iv) Reducing mobility of rural population by helping them to stabilize and settle in permanent agriculture and thus to decrease migration towards urban centres and other countries;

(v) Promoting integrated agricultural and forestry development with the ultimate aim of a substantial increase of food and wood production;

(vi) Development of anti-desertification measures, including improvement of range lands and regulation of grazing, with the aim of reducing wind and water erosion;

(vii) Training of local people in improved irrigated agriculture technologies.

II. BACKGROUND

The project was undertaken by UNEP and AGFUND in co-operation with the Government of the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen and with the collaboration of UNEPCOM. It is a response to recommendations 3 and 4 of the Plan of Action to Combat Desertification, which called for countries to adopt an integrated approach to development, together with appropriate economic and demographic policies to support programmes for improving land use and productivity in arid ecosystems. The area chosen for the project was quite arid, with scanty rainfall (200mm annually) and soil composed mainly of alluvial deposits. The focus of the project was to develop and apply, on a pilot basis, an ecologically sound approach to the use of water and land resources, thus controlling the spread of desertification.

An important element of the project was to test an experimental approach which could then be replicated both at the national and regional levels, and, eventually, in other arid areas of the world.

/...

With the first phase of the project coming to an end in mid 1989, it was decided that it would be useful to undertake an in-depth evaluation to assess progress and determine future courses of action, including the possible extension of the project. Accordingly, in December 1988, an external expert from the region visited the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen to evaluate the project. The mission included field visits, as well as extensive discussions with local government officials, and project and UNEP personnel.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the project

Applying an integrated approach to the development of agriculture and forestry through environmentally sound management and improvement of resources is undoubtedly a possible tool of combating desertification. In this respect then, the general intent of the project can be said to be relevant.

However, the way in which the project was designed and executed reduced its relevance, particularly in terms of replicability. The project by definition was experimental, but was conceived in a manner that was inappropriate to both local social circumstances and environmental conditions. In this respect, the project was much less relevant. The reasons for this are discussed below.

2. Appropriateness of project design

As indicated above, the intent of the project was appropriate in the context of an integrated approach to combating desertification. All the essential elements were described in the project document: improvement of water management and irrigation systems; conservation and improvement of soil; afforestation; rangeland management; improvement of crops; creation of better economic opportunities.

The means chosen to combat desertification, however, appear to have been largely inappropriate to circumstances. Not only were the approaches used (such as massive land levelling) or technology applied (the use of a sprinkler system) highly inappropriate in the environmental and social context of the project area, but the institutional setting was given insufficient attention. The project areas was part of a large state farm, but few if any attempts were made to link project activities up with the longer-term development of the farm. Furthermore, the use of sophisticated equipment required by the project design was self defeating because of inadequate local knowledge for its upkeep.

The project called for carrying out an environmental impact assessment and cost-benefit analysis upon completion of activities. The use of these techniques as an ex-post facto investigation is somewhat inappropriate, as they should have been used before the project was initiated, rather than at its end.

Finally, the fact that UNEP, an agency which does not have full field capacity, should be ultimately responsible for project management could not but influence the project negatively.

/...

3. Efficiency of project implementation

Various problems affected the project and led to considerable delays. Initially, the project activities were to be undertaken in 24 months, but this period eventually was extended by 44 additional months, to a total of 68 months. In all, 10 revisions to the project were approved, changing the duration, scheduling of activities and increases in the funding. An important impediment was the delay in recruiting foreign experts and in receiving project equipment, including machinery for levelling the earth and materials such as plastic piping and fertilizer.

In addition, the machinery broke down repeatedly, and there were delays in repairing it because of lack of spare parts and local expertise. Although the life span of the machinery was estimated at approximately five years, it became inserviceable after only one year. This meant a serious financial loss, as the total cost of the machines in question was around US$265,000, that is, more than 10 per cent of the total project cost.

In spite of these problems, most of the anticipated outputs of the project were produced, including 140 ha of newly levelled land, 100 ha fenced off for rangeland management, 1100 m^3 reservoir, a drip irrigation system for 125 ha of orchard area, an electric generator connected to 6 tubewells to irrigate 80 ha, a tree nursery which distributed 32,000 of seedlings to the local population, a certain number of windbreaks and a network of earth roads, as well as one-km section of irrigation channels using PVC pipes and another 1 km with cement lining. Six technicians were trained, two of whom joined the project, and the remainder went to work in the Agriculture Research Department.

Taking account of the time and funds involved the outputs produced by the project cannot be considered cost-effective.

4. Effectiveness and impact of the project

The effectiveness of the project in fulfilling its immediate aims has been satisfactory, even though there have been considerable time and money overruns. The Government is satisfied with the results and wishes to replicate the project elsewhere.

The overall impact of the project on the livelihood, productivity and long-term control of desertification cannot yet be determined, but so far appears positive. However, a longer-term evaluation will be necessary to determine the effects of land levelling (with apparent loss of topsoil) and irrigation with saline water (6 out of 11 wells are saline). The replicability of the project will also have to be tested.

5. Catalytic role of UNEP and the role of the partners

UNEP's catalytic role was not very significant, as there are many similar activities being carried out in People's Democratic Republic of Yemen by other international and regional organizations. Moreover, these activities are not co-ordinated. UNEP could have made a good contribution and discharged its function of co-ordination by assisting the Government in this respect.

/...

The Ministry of Agriculture dealt effectively with the day to day execution of the project, but perhaps could have made its contribution more useful if it had co-ordinated the activities of the project with the broader action being undertaken at the state farm where the project area is situated. The experts who worked on the project did a creditable job, although they were slow in providing their support in a timely manner. AGFUND was not directly involved in the project, but its funding made the project possible.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Government of the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen is well satisfied with the project, given the fact that the desired outputs were produced. In spite of this success, the overall utility of projects such as this needs to be questioned. In the absence of concerted efforts to arrest desertification and a more cost-effective means of doing so, efforts of this sort will remain isolated, and, as such, of limited utility.

Specific recommendations

To highten the long-term impact of the project, it is recommended that:

1. The field work foreseen in revision 10 of the project should be completed, after which UNEP could consider its support concluded.

2. While UNEP will not be involved in the later phases of the project, it has the moral responsibility to follow-up and address the issue of replication in the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen with the clear understanding that any such action would be funded by the Government, bilateral donors or UNDP.

3. The results of the project thus far should be translated into operational manuals, showing the necessary steps for planning, design, implementation, management and financing of the various activities tested experimentally and which could usefully be replicated. These could include subjects such as land levelling and soil management, irrigation systems, rangeland management, livestock breeding, farm management and agricultural practices.

4. The manuals should be supplemented by comprehensive in-service training programmes, with short theoretical courses in the capital. Foreign experts should be assigned as trainers for short periods.

5. Separate programmes should be prepared for land reclamation and land management on the project site, maximizing all available inputs.

General recommendations

If UNEP is to increase the value of its support to Governments, it should not undertake to support field project, as it does not have sufficient field capacity to monitor and control action effectively. Instead, UNEP should concentrate on assisting Governments to design appropriate policies and strategies which can then elicit donor support.

/...

In-depth Evaluation

Title: UNEP SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SOUTH PACIFIC REGIONAL ENVIRONMENT PROGRAMME (SPREP) - FP/0503-82-14 (2371)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Supporting organizations: South Pacific Commission (SPC), in association with South Pacific Bureau for Economic Co-operation (SPEC) and The Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP)

Scope: Regional: South Pacific (American Samoa, Cook Islands, Federated States of Micronesia, Fiji, French Polynesia, Guam, Kiribati, Marshall Islands, Nauru, New Caledonia, Niue, Northern Mariana Islands, Palau, Papua New Guinea, Pitcairn Island, Solomon Islands, Tokelau, Tonga, Tuvalu, Vanuatu, Wallis and Futuna, Western Samoa)

Duration: November 1982 - March 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	1,631,318	33
To SPC	3,758,297	66
To SPEC	124,600	.5
To ESCAP	125,788	.5
Total	5,640,003	100

Objectives:

Objectives, strategies and goals of the Environment Programme

The project is contributing to the Medium-term Plan concerning Oceans, Marine Pollution and Regional Seas (paragraphs 102-113 of UNEP/GC.9/6); it will contribute specifically to the implementation of the Action Plan for the South Pacific Regional Environment Programme (SPREP), as called for in the Governing Council decision 6/10.

Anticipated contribution of the project to the Environment Programme

The project will assist in the continued development of action plans for the regional seas areas included in the UNEP programme and will contribute to:

(i) Geographically balanced implementation of the Regional Seas Programme;

(ii) Implementation of an Action Plan for the SPREP Region based on priorities defined by the Governments of that Region;

/...

(iii) Efforts of developing countries to protect their marine and coastal resources through co-ordinated environmental assessment projects and environmentally-sound management practices.

Purpose of the project

The main purpose of the project is to support the implementation of SPREP as defined by the Conference on the Human Environment in the South Pacific, i.e. "to achieve the primary objective of the SPREP to help the countries of the South Pacific to maintain and improve their shared environment and to enhance their capacity to provide the present and future resource base to support the quality of life of the people" (Action Plan for Managing the Natural Resources and Environment of the South Pacific Region adopted at the Conference on the Human Environment in the South Pacific, Rarotonga, 8-11 March 1982).

II. BACKGROUND

UNEP's involvement in SPREP is based on the decisions of the UNEP Governing Council at its second session in 1974, which defined the Pacific as a priority area for a regional environmental programme. The impetus for its development came from SPC in 1974.

Consultations between SPC and UNEP in 1974, joined soon afterwards by the SPEC and ESCAP, led to the decision to organize a South Pacific Conference on the Human Environment under the joint sponsorship of SPC, SPEC, ESCAP and UNEP. It was convened in Rarotonga, in March 1982, under the joint sponsorship of SPC, SPEC, ESCAP and UNEP. The Conference adopted: a comprehensive Action Plan for Managing the Natural Resources and Environment of the South Pacific Region; the South Pacific Declaration on Natural Resources and the Environment; a set of four Conference Resolutions. The Conference also endorsed the report on the State of the Environment in the South Pacific. The implementation of the SPREP Action Plan itself followed the lines of decisions taken by the Rarotonga Conference as a programme jointly sponsored by SPC, SPEC, ESCAP and UNEP.

At its sixth session in 1978, the UNEP Governing Council endorsed UNEP's involvement in the implementation of SPREP as a joint co-operative programme of SPC, SPEC, ESCAP and the relevant bodies of the United Nations system within the framework of UNEP's Regional Seas Programme.

The negotiation of a legal framework for SPREP began at UNEP's initiative in 1983. Four meetings of legal experts and one high-level meeting were convened in 1983, 1984 and 1986. The negotiations were concluded at the Conference of Plenipotentiaries in November 1986 which adopted the: Convention for the Protection of Natural Resources and Environment of the South Pacific Region; the Protocol concerning Co-operation in Combating Pollution Emergencies in the South Pacific Region; and the Protocol for the Prevention of Pollution of the South Pacific Region by Dumping.

An Action Strategy for Protected Areas in the South Pacific Region was adopted at the third South Pacific National Parks and Reserves Conference organized in 1985 by the Secretariat of SPREP in co-operation with IUCN and the host country. The adopted Strategy is in full conformity with the objectives of the SPREP action plan and of the IUCN/WWF/UNEP World Conservation Strategy.

The institutional arrangements for the SPREP Action Plan consisted of a Co-ordinating Group that acted as a central co-ordinating mechanism, and the Secretariat, which acted as an independent entity within SPC, working under the guidance of the Co-ordinating Group. In late 1988, the Co-ordinating Group was replaced by a Steering Committee of Governments, with the former Co-ordinating Group members as advisers. The SPC is responsible for carrying out the Secretariat functions for the SPREP Convention. Other institutional arrangements include the SPREP Research and Monitoring Network (RMN) and the SPREP Environmental Education, Training and Information Network (EETIN) which serve as the institutional basis for a large number of projects carried out in the framework of SPREP. An Association of South Pacific Environmental Institutions was created to provide a more formal channel of communication between the co-operating institutions and SPREP and to serve as a mechanism to execute joint projects.

The financial arrangements of the Action Plan include the contributions of participating Governments and associated institutions. Contributions of SPEC, ESCAP and UNEP to the implementation of SPREP have been earmarked to specific SPREP activities that are in line with the mandates, programmes and priorities of these organizations. UNEP's support, particularly for the Secretariat of SPREP and for the common costs, was specifically contingent on SPREP being the South Pacific component of the UNEP Regional Seas Programme.

The in-depth evaluation of the South Pacific Regional Environment Programme (SPREP) was prepared by the Oceans and Coastal Areas Programme Activity Centre of UNEP on the basis of information available in the files of UNEP and of information supplied by the secretariat of SPREP. Two senior consultants assisted in its preparation. It covers the preparatory phase and subsequent implementation until the end of 1987.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the programme

The adoption of the SPREP Action Plan and Convention by 27 political entities of the South Pacific region, scattered over a vast area, is undoubtedly a major achievement. This is reinforced by the fact that not only do the major States of the region give unqualified support to the programme, but the small island States and territories have become the most ardent supporters of SPREP and genuinely feel it as their "own" programme.

This interest and active participation of all States and territories of the region signifies that SPREP is considered as highly relevant for safeguarding the natural heritage and for the future development of the region on an environmentally sound and sustainable basis.

2. Appropriateness of the programme design

The manner in which the programme was organized has proved to be highly appropriate. The most important design element that has determined the success of the programme is the establishment of a working structure wherein Governments, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations can co-operate.

This structure consists of the SPREP Secretariat, which is responsible for technical co-ordination of the implementation of the Action Plan. National focal points identified by all participating States and territories serve as efficient channels of communication with the Secretariat. International and intergovernmental and regional organizations, including SPC, SPEC, ESCAP and UNEP, jointly sponsor the programme and act through a Co-ordinating Group. The arrangements also allow for contributions from other international organizations, and, through the life of the programme have included the Intergovernmental Maritime Organization (IMO), the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) and the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN).

Finally, the structure has shown itself flexible enough to allow the establishment of networks, enabling a large number of research and training institutions in the region to contribute to the programme by playing an important role in the implementation of numerous projects.

3. Efficiency and effectiveness of the implementation of the programme

Overall, the efficiency and effectiveness with which SPREP has been conducted has been high, although it is difficult to evaluate fully the actual results because of the absence of a continuous feedback from users and collaborators. It must be pointed out, however, that the technical expertise available in the SPREP Secretariat was not strong enough to guide and supervise effectively the substantive implementation of all aspects of the Action Plan. This has perhaps conditioned the overall shape of the programme of SPREP. Although it was conceived as regional and designed to deal with issues of regional significance, as well as with problems requiring regional solutions, it has for the most part dealt with these subjects mainly at the national or local level.

Technical assistance has been effectively provided to the institutions of the region participating in the networks, through the support of experts or the supply of equipment and materials. This has been very useful in enhancing their capability to help Governments in the field of environmental assessment and management. However, the actual requests from the national focal points for assistance received by the SPREP Secretariat have sometimes been poorly defined; this has delayed an effective response.

The training component of the programme has been carried out in a satisfactory manner. To date, over 200 individuals have benefited. Until 1987, training was undertaken in an ad hoc manner or as part of the activities carried out by the research and monitoring network, but recently, there have been efforts towards greater co-ordination.

The environmental education and information component of the programme has been more effective. It has included assistance to teaching institutions to develop environmental curricula and inter-disciplinary undergraduate programmes in environmental science. A considerable body of information has been provided through activities undertaken in the region - over 100 technical reports and publications over a period of 5 years. Other publications - such as regional directories and bibliographies, a regional environmental education journal and the newsletter of the SPREP Secretariat - have been very effective. General environmental awareness has also improved through support to NGOs that disseminate information.

The funding of the programme has been somewhat more problematic. To date, no definite commitment has been made by the countries of the region for a permanent funding of SPREP. There have been thus frequent cash flow problems. There has also been too heavy a reliance on UNEP funding, which has introduced a bias into the programme.

4. Impact of the programme

It is difficult to evaluate the impact of SPREP precisely, particularly because the number of participating States is so large and the geographic area the programme covers is so immense. Furthermore, the programme reflects the very large number of subjects and programmes that are relevant to the region. Because of this breadth of coverage, the programme actions have perhaps been spread too thinly. However, it has proved its value and has stood its ground in depth if not in breadth of the areas tackled.

One factor which lessens the possible impact of the programme is the fact that the SPREP Convention adopted in Noumea on 25 November 1986 and signed by 12 of the 19 elegible parties had been ratified by five countries and acceded to by two others by the end of 1989.

The extent of changes in national legislation following the implementation of the Action Plan are difficult to evaluate. Some significant developments have occurred, however, among them, the development of regional guidelines for pesticide use which provide an initial basis for reviewing national legislation and regulations.

5. Catalytic role of UNEP and the role of the partners

UNEP's intellectual and financial input has been of vital importance in both the preparatory and implementation phases of the programme. UNEP's involvement is thus fully justified, since without this involvement, it is unlikely that SPREP would have progressed as far and as fast as it has.

The remarkably serious participation of the Governments and national institutions in the Action Plan is evidence of solid, broad support for the programme, which augurs well for the long-term prospect of its development.

The involvement and co-operation of other specialized United Nations bodies has not been achieved adequately. Consequently the potential benefits from such co-operation - which is a striking feature of other regional seas programmes - has not been forthcoming.

/...

The role of the SPREP Secretariat has been somewhat ambiguous. Its position within SPC and its relation to the UNEP Regional Seas Programme had given rise, towards the end of the period covered by this evaluation, to friction and misunderstandings. This has hampered the effectiveness of the programme. Furthermore, the relations between the Secretariat and the major research and training institutions in the region have not always been harmonious.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATONS

The South Pacific Regional Environment Programme is a highly successful programme, with an approved Action Plan, which covers a great range of subjects and is well-placed to expand along the lines originally envisaged by the Rarotonga Conference. The participation of the totality of island States, as well as that of the large nations of the region, is indicative of the high degree of interest and acceptance it has achieved.

While it is difficult to assess the contribution of SPREP to date in improving the environmental status of the South Pacific region, it can be said without hesitation that it does provide the appropriate framework for promoting environmental protection and sustainable development in the future.

Restricted availability of human resources is one of the reasons for an under-representation of the region in the United Nations and other international or regional bodies. The result is that its problems (financial and otherwise) are not sufficiently voiced. This is true also for environmental concerns. A series of beneficial results for the region could be expected if the few participating member States that belong to the governing bodies of such international organizations were given the authority to speak on behalf of SPREP. The idea was raised at the recent intergovernmental meeting and the recommendation to act accordingly needs to be implemented.

In-depth Evaluation

Title: MONITORING OF POLLUTION IN THE MARINE ENVIRONMENT OF WEST AND CENTRAL AFRICAN REGION (WACAF/2) - FP/5102-82-20

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Co-operating Agencies: Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission (IOC) of Unesco, World Health Organization (WHO) and the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA)

Scope: Sub-regional: West and Central African Region (Angola, Benin, Cape Verde, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea Bissau, Ivory Coast, Liberia, Mauritania, Nigeria, Sao Tome and Principe, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Togo, Cameroon, Zaire)

Duration: November 1982 - June 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP the Fund of UNEP	624,539	41
To WACAF Trust Fund	517,102	34
To FAO (in kind)	147,000	9
To IOC (in kind)	112,800	7
To WHO (in kind)	54,700	4
To IAEA (in kind)	71,000	5
Total	1,527,141	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) To arrange and organize appropriate training of scientists and technicians from the region;

(ii) To provide necessary equipment (and maintenance) for pollution monitoring activities;

(iii) To arrange for appropriate intercalibration exercises between laboratories participating in pollution monitoring;

(iv) To plan and begin field collections and analyses of samples for various pollution parameters.

/...

Long-term objectives

(i) To establish a co-ordinated regional marine pollution monitoring programme, based on intercomparable methods, to be used for the assessment of the sources, levels and effects of pollutants on marine life and human health;

(ii) To compile an inventory of the sources and quantities of pollutants reaching the coastal waters of the region from land-based and maritime sources;

(iii) To encourage and support the training of regional scientists and technicians in methods and techniques related to the assessment and evaluation of marine pollution;

(iv) To encourage and support the exchange of information on techniques, data and interpretation;

(v) To contribute to the International Global Environment Monitoring System (GEMS) as it applies to the world's oceans.

II. BACKGROUND

The Action Plan for the Protection and Development of the Marine Environment and Coastal Areas of the West and Central African Region was adopted by the Conference of Plenipotentiaries, held in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, from 16-23 March 1981.

The formulation and development of the Action Plan was assisted through several projects that are of particular relevance to the present project: FP/0503-77-02, resulting in the publication "The Gulf of Guinea: Pollution, the need for control and possible mechanisms thereof"; FP/0503-77-04, resulting in the IOC/FAO/WHO/UNEP International Workshop on Marine Pollution in the Gulf of Guinea and Adjacent Areas; FP/0503-77-17, resulting in the IMCO/UNEP publication: Status of Oil Pollution and Oil Pollution Control in West and Central African Region: FP/0503-70-18, resulting in the UNIDO/UNEP publication: Survey of Marine Pollutants from Industrial Sources in the West and Central African Region: FP/0503-79-20, resulting in the Unesco/UNEP publication: River Inputs to the West and Central African Marine Environment.

The monitoring of marine pollutants to provide an adequate assessment of the occurrence and possible effects of these substances requires careful sampling, the analysis of indicator materials by intercalibrated methods that have been widely accepted, and the compilation of a data base for interpretation.

The programme covered by the present project is aimed at achieving an assessment of marine pollution in West and Central Africa and accomplished by the establishment of the levels of selected marine pollutants in biota, resulting in a preliminary assessment of marine pollution in the Region. The degree to which the recreational waters and seafood obtained in the Region represent health hazards will also be ascertained.

/...

The in-depth evaluation of the project was carried out by an external consultant in December 1988. The present summary is based on the full length version of the evaluation available at UNEP.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the project

The project is relevant in the sense that monitoring and eventual control of pollution is an important element of any environmental management plan for the marine and coastal environment. This said, it is not very clear whether both the overall programme and the project itself are considered topical and of relevance to the Governments involved. The very fact that there has not been full adhesion [commitment] by them to either the programme as a whole, or the particular project itself would seem to indicate this.

2. Appropriateness of project design

There is no doubt that the project was well designed in substantive terms. The objectives were clearly spelled out and were feasible. The work itself was articulated among four major activities, the responsibility for which was evenly divided between the four main participating agencies. Each agency was entrusted with dealing specifically with a matter directly relevant to its work.

As UNEP was designated the overall co-ordinator for the programme, there was a built-in requirement to report project matters directly to it and to operate through the UNEP focal points in the region. With hindsight, it seems that this arrangement complicated matters unnecessarily.

Finally, it is apparent that the financial arrangements envisaged for the project were not very appropriate either. To predicate the availability of funds on the assumptions that Governments would contribute to the Trust Fund was not logical, given their reluctance to acceed to the Convention, and by extension, give their full support to the project.

3. Efficiency and effectiveness of project implementation

Because of initial delays in signing the project document, the project had a slow start. Thereafter, however, it progressed very quickly. Both the United Nations partners and the national institutions participated enthusiastically, and work progressed well. As the project continued, however, problems became increasingly manifest.

Unfortunately, not all the institutes that participated in the programme were fully equipped to do so. They lacked the essential services required, either to allow them to collect samples or to process them adequately to the stage at which they could be analysed. These problems might have been avoided or reduced had there been greater co-operation among the institutes in the individual countries. As a result they started falling back in the delivery of monitoring results and the analyses could not be fully carried out. Some of the institutes reported only irregularly and several declined to use the established reporting format. The essence of a project of this nature is co-operation and adherance to common procedures, and in their absence, no valid results can be obtained.

/...

Another fairly serious problem was the equipment. Some of the equipment supplied was eventually found to be unsuitable for conditions in the area. Some was delivered only after considerable delays and, in at least one case, the equipment was never installed because of lack of suitable facilities. Equipment constantly kept breaking down and the arrangements for maintenance and repair were never satisfactory.

The training component of the project worked well. The number of people trained were less numerous than initially expected, but this is a function of the fact that fewer countries than expected participated in the project. The strategy adopted for training was very effective. It started off by training people externally and then moved to delivering courses and holding seminars locally. The trainees provided good service, although some of them changed their jobs and are no longer connected with the project. This is not necessarily a negative outcome, as the expertise remains within the region.

The WACAF-2 Newsletter was of good quality and has clearly met the needs of exchanging the results of the project, ideas and general information at a regional level reasonably quickly.

Communication between the agencies worked well initially, but after some time, deteriorated. The most serious problem in this connection was that although FAO was supposed to act as the general co-ordinator and organizer of activities, in many instances it did not receive sufficient information from UNEP or from the other agencies. WHO, for its part, insisted on working through its own contacts rather than through the UNEP focal points, as had been agreed. This introduced a certain element of confusion.

In spite of these difficulties surrounding the implementation, by the end of 1987 most of the short-term goals of the project had been achieved.

4. Impact of the project

The impact of the project is difficult to ascertain. Most of the objectives were met, but in the absence of full ratification of the Abidjan Convention, the eventual usefulness of these results are questionable. Be that as it may, there is now a good picture of the level and type of contamination in the region that furnishes the opportunity for positive action for their future control, provided the sources of these contaminations are determined.

5. Catalytic role of UNEP

UNEP has undoubtedly exerted its catalytic role very effectively, particularly in the initial stages of the development of the overall programme. UNEP was instrumental in the development of the Abidjan Convention, as well as of the various projects under WACAF. This initial positive start has not, however, borne fruit. As indicated earlier, less than half of the countries have formally adopted the Convention. This detracts from the positive nature of the catalysis.

FAO was responsible for the analysis of different contaminants, as well as purchasing equipment and training scientists. It discharged its role of co-ordinator of all agency activities in the field effectively.

IAEA was responsible for the intercalibration of analytical techniques, the preparation of standards and maintenance of analytical equipment. IOC was responsible for activities related to observation of oil slicks and basic oceanographic observations related to pollutant transport in the region. Both of these agencies made good contributions of their respective fields of responsibility.

WHO was responsible for monitoring microbiological quality of sea waters and food. It discharged its responsibilities despite persistent problems that retarded progress.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has achieved its objectives, albeit over a much longer period than expected. There is now a good picture of the situation regarding pollution within the region. The main problem remains the slow pace of ratification of the Abidjan Convention, which makes future action under WACAF questionable.

In general terms, it is strongly recommended that the slow pace of ratifying the Convention be investigated and that the necessary measures to encourage Governments to do so as soon as possible be taken.

In more specific terms, it is recommended that:

(i) Institutes and equipment should be selected more carefully and backup and maintenance services should be provided;

(ii) Now that the profile of pollution types is known, the identification of the exact sources should proceed so that remedial action can take place;

(iii) Better co-operation and better reporting procedures should also be adopted.

Desk Evaluation

Title: CONTINUING SUPPORT TO NATIONAL FOCAL POINTS FOR THE INTEGRATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL COMPONENTS INTO CURRICULA OF BUSINESS SCHOOLS - FP/3102-87-08 (2738):

A. ILO/UNEP/Employers' Confederation of Thailand (ECOT) Environmental Management Training Seminar (Bangkok, January 1989)

B. ILO/UNEP/Employers' Association of Indonesia (APINDO) Environmental Management Training Seminar (Jakarta, January 1989)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Co-operating Agency ILO: in association with national institutions

Scope: Asia and Latin America

Duration: November 1987 - April 1990

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	120,000	46
To ILO	140,000	54
Total	260,000	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(a) To provide continuing support to the existing network of 22 focal points in Asia and Latin America;

(b) To encourage the 22 focal points to train approximately 10,000 managers (22 x 2 years x 230 each year) in concepts of environmental management from the business sector (using the "multiplier effect" of the existing focal point networks and supervisory visits); and to encourage focal points to initiate environmental management activities directly related to resolving specific problems in this field;

(c) To provide two specially selected focal points (one each in Asia and Latin America) with a self-sustaining national capacity for a full range of environmental management consulting/training services, using action oriented methods to achieve the improvement of environmental management in specific business and agricultural enterprises;

(d) To provide environmental management training for planners in agricultural extension, as well as development and management of agricultural enterprises, so as to alert them to the adverse environmental impacts of rapid agricultural development;

/...

(e) To assist focal points in mobilizing outside funding for such activities as translation and publication of training materials into other national languages, initiation of research projects, production of a limited range of video materials, fellowships for working exchanges in technical co-operation among developing countries, TCDC, mass media link-up and general co-operation with other UNEP projects.

Long-term objectives

(a) To improve the standard of environmental management practices in business schools (management and agricultural) in Asia and Latin America;

(b) To promote environmental management activities directly related to resolving specific environmental management problems.

II. BACKGROUND

The project is a continuation of other related projects, namely, "Introduction of an Environmental Training Component within ILO Management Development Programmes" FP/3102-80-01 (2072) directed to promoting the concept in Asia, and "Introduction of Environmental Components in Training Programmes of the ILO and the International Institute of Labour Studies (IILS)" FP/3102-84-01 (2527) for Latin America. These projects have achieved positive results and provided effective tools in the form of training materials for environmental management.

These two projects established focal points in nine countries in Asia and 13 countries in Latin America. The present project was set up to give continued support to these focal points in carrying out training courses, among other activities.

Below are two desk evaluations of two two-day seminars in Asia that give an indication of how the training component is progressing. The evaluation was carried out on the basis of questionnaires filled in by the trainees.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

A. ILO-UNEP-ECOT Environmental Management Training Seminar (Bangkok, January 1989)

1. Profile of the trainees

A total of 23 responses were received from among 38 listed trainees. The majority came from industry (18) and from the service sector (5) (including engineering consultants and research and development institutes). Eight of those trainees held managerial positions; six had technical jobs; three came from safety and environmental units; two from personnel departments; and five performed other functions. Ten had received no previous training in environmental matters; seven had some training; four had considerable training; and two were fully qualified professionals in this field.

2. Influence on action at the national level

Many participants (14) considered that the seminar had influenced their actions, while one took an opposing view. Three felt that the question was not applicable to them (largely because their previous training had been more advanced).

3. Quality of the seminar

The level of the seminar was considered to be appropriate by 15 participants. Three stated that it was too general and three that it was too specialized.

With regard to the five topics presented, the highest interest was raised by "Pollution Prevention Pays", which received 14 votes, and by "Environmental Planning and Management", which received 13 votes. "Environmental Law and Administration" received 11 votes, "Employers and the Environmental Challenge" 9 votes and "Functions and Uses of the Environment" 7 votes. One participant gave the highest mark to the lecture (in Thai) on national environmental action. Several participants gave equal approval to all the topics presented.

Among the four audio-visual documents presented, the highest ratings were given to "The Seveso Heritage" (15) and to "To Site a Mill" (14). "State of the Planet" and "Through the Mill Once More" each received nine votes. The length of the films was generally considered appropriate in relation to the total time frame.

Overall, there was considerable satisfaction with the quality of the seminar courses.

4. Future action by ECOT

Future environmental action by ECOT was considered desirable by all participants. Nine stressed the need for action in access to appropriate technology, five emphasized governmental co-ordination, four training, three the economics and cost aspects, two legislation and three on providing general environmental information.

5. Other observations

Various other comments and suggestions were made, in particular the need for a continuing training programme, including courses with greater specialization in such fields as solid and liquid waste management, toxic materials, traffic-related pollution and water resource management. Some participants observed that there was a need for more research and development support by private industry and greater access to international sources of data and information, as well as for public education and information.

B. ILO-UNEP-APINDO Environmental Management Training Seminar (Jakarta, January 1989)

1. Profile of the trainees

The total of 48 questionnaires returned revealed that 32 participants came from industry, in particular the petroleum industry (including related service industries); this accounted for no less than 22 participants. Eleven came from the service (tertiary) sector (e.g., telecommunications, transport and distribution) and five from industrial organizations (APINDO and its regional branches).

The professional level of participants was relatively high: 27 had managerial responsibilities, 20 came from technical departments (engineering, production and maintenance), 11 from environmental and safety departments, 3 from personnel and labour relations and 2 from general administration. The remainder were not clearly identified.

Among the 48 trainees who replied, 27 had received no training and 21 had been trained before. Among the latter, 12 had received some training, 7 had considerable training and 2 were qualified professionals in their field.

2. Influence on action at the national level

Forty participants gave a positive answer, stating that they had found the course useful, while five considered that the course had not been influential. The latter were mainly qualified environmental managers from companies with a develcped environmental programme. Among those who replied positively, eight considered the effect to be immediate (better current performance) and six expected future improvement (mainly as their jobs expanded).

3. Quality of the Seminar

Twenty-eight stated that the technical level of the seminar was appropriate, 16 that it was too general and 4 that it was too specialized.

In respect of the appreciation of the different course subjects, the highest ratings went to topic 4, "Pollution prevention pays", (25 replies), topic 2, "Environmental law and administration", (23 replies) and topic 5, "Employers' organizations and environmental challenge", (21 replies). Topic 3, "Environmental planning and management", received 15 responses and topic 1, "Functions and uses of the environment", 11 responses as the most relevant among the five topics. Several additional suggestions were made, mostly of a more technical nature (e.g. toxic materials management).

In respect of the four audio-visual documents, the highest ratings went to "The Seveso Heritage" (30), "To Site a Mill" (20), "State of the Planet" (19) and "Through the Mill once More" (16). About half trainees considered that all the films were relevant. Thirteen felt the length was appropriate and one that the films were too long.

/...

4. Future APINDO action

It was suggested that the most important field of action was co-ordination with government (25 replies). Next in importance was training (13 replies), followed by technology support, including consultancies (11 replies), information on environment (6 replies), legislation (4 replies) and economics (1 reply).

5. Other observations

Observations and suggestions varied in nature and extent, including the publication of a manual for enterprises, more APINDO publicity, co-operation with the Chamber of Commerce, inclusion of the working environment, requests for films, complaints about weakness or slowness in government, etc. Twenty proposals were made.

IV. MEETING OF THE PROJECT OBJECTIVES

In respect of meeting the short-term objectives, the two courses reviewed have definitely been useful and, taken together with the other courses, it is clear that the training objectives will be met at the end of the project.

In respect of the long-term objectives, these are to be seen in a broader time frame, but it is clear that the project will help to achieve them in due course.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

It is clear that the courses are appreciated by the trainees and that they are contributing to strengthening the environmental management practices in the region. Given the practical applications of the seminars, it is recommended that the specialized topics, be strengthened and that the choice of these topics be co-ordinated more closely with Governments so that they respond to national real needs.

Project Manager's Evaluation

Title: SURVEY OF THE STATE OF WORLD LAKES (Phase I)
FP/5201-87-02 (2736)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Internal, in association with International Lake Environment Committee (ILEC)

Scope: Global

Duration: March 1987 - June 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	54,624	28
To PPSC	60,750	31
To ILEC	81,255*	41
Total	196,629	100

* US$4,000 of this amount has been contributed in cash to UNEP.

Objectives:

Short-term objective

To secure basic data and a preliminary assessment of the state of the environmental management of at least 50 lakes in different countries.

Long-term objective

To assist Governments to promote environmentally sound management of lakes, including the sustainable development of their watersheds.

Anticipated and actual outputs:

(i) Publication of 500 copies of the interim report on The State of world lakes in English, which includes collated and edited data, with preliminary assessments on at least 50 large lakes. This was done in 1988;

(ii) Preparation of an in-depth comparative study on the present environmental status of 10 selected lakes. This was done in 1988;

(iii) Distribution of 3,500 copies of a pamphlet describing UNEP's programme for Environmentally Sound Management of Inland Waters (IMINWA) and ILEC's participation in it. This was done in 1988;

(iv) Publication of an illustrated book, tentatively entitled "Lakes of the World" was suggested by the UNEP Information and Public Affairs Branch (IPA) at a later stage of the project implementation. This, however, was not prepared due to changes in IPA policy.

/...

Use of Outputs

(i) The interim report was distributed according to the UNEP mailing list, i.e. largely to Governments and organizations working on water management;

(ii) The in-depth study was circulated among the Working Group, Editorial Board and UNEP staff for evaluation and for determining the strategy for follow-up phases of the project;

(iii) The pamphlet was distributed by UNEP and ILEC largely at conferences, training courses and workshops.

II. MEETING PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The short-term objective of the project was met by the publication of the State of world lakes and the in-depth comparative study on the status of 10 selected lakes.

The achievement of the long-term objective is well under way, given the fact that the report was so well received by both governmental and non-governmental organizations.

The catalytic effect of the project appears to be good inasmuch as ILEC and the Academy of Limnology of the USSR have started discussions on the possibility of undertaking joint work by including data on lakes of the USSR in subsequent volumes of the interim report. They will also jointly organize a training course on lake management in the Lake Chad basin under the Centre for International Projects (CIP)/UNEP project FP/5201-87-01. GEMS/GRID will incorporate the data collected.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has produced satisfactory results and, judging from the positive response to questionnaires, the quality of the reports is high. One conclusion that can be drawn from this experience is that well established NGOs, working in collaboration with the United Nations can achieve positive and long-lasting results.

It is recommended that UNEP should consider:

(a) Continuation of support for publication of the subsequent issue of the Interim Report;

(b) Publicizing the integration of collected data into the GEMS/GRID data-base;

(c) Development of tools and procedures for managing lakes based on the data collected.

Project Manager's Evaluation

Title: NETWORK FOR INDUSTRIAL ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT (NIEM)
FP/MH/8201-87-01 (2727)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Internal

Scope: Asia and the Pacific

Duration: February 1987 - March 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	8,908	2
To Trust Fund (contributed by NIEM)	159,505	43
Counterpart contribution (by SIDA)	203,000	55
Total	371,413	100

Objectives:

Short-term objective

To demonstrate that the NIEM concept is viable as a pre-condition to full scale implementation of the NIEM programme.

Long-term objectives

(i) To enhance the environmental management capabilities of environmental agencies and industries in Asia and the Pacific region countries; and

(ii) To facilitate technical co-operation, assistance and training among countries in Asia and the Pacific region, as well as with countries in other regions.

Anticipated and actual outputs:

Against the six expected outputs, the following five were achieved.

(i) Protocols for collaboration, sub-programme projects and locations, report formats, co-ordination mechanisms and monitoring procedures, and project timetables;

(ii) A manual on receiving water quality monitoring and measurements aimed at mill operators, government personnel, and researchers concerned with pulp and paper mills;

/...

(iii) A manual on discharge characterization for the pulp and paper industry;

(iv) A guide outlining simplified and practical methods and procedures for assessment of environmental impacts of existing small pulp and paper mills;

(v) Twenty-six trained personnel from participating institutions in the seven countries, as well as a short guide on the organization of training workshops and the manuals and guides mentioned here, which together form a preliminary training package;

The sixth expected output, i.e. "A review document on the present state-of-the-art on procedures and methodologies for environmental impact assessment of new industrial projects" was deferred, because of the completion and publication of the UNEP booklet "EIA Basic Procedures for Developing Countries".

In addition the following outputs were produced and distributed.

(i) A bibliography of publications held by NIEM member institutions related to environmental control in the pulp and paper industry;

(ii) Four issues of the quarterly NIEM Newsletter;

(iii) A manual on receiving land quality evaluation;

(iv) A guide on determination of acute lethal toxicity of pulp and paper mill effluent to freshwater fish;

(v) Reports on the six mill field studies.

Use of outputs

The outputs are being used by 32 institutions in eight countries. The manuals and guidelines will also benefit government, research, academic and industrial institutions throughout the region. These have already been distributed by UNEP's Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP) in consultation with UNEP's Industry and Environment Office (IEO). Some participating countries are planning to organize national training programmes, thus ensuring a multiplier effect.

Meeting of short-term objectives:

The results of the implementation of Phase I have clearly reinforced the viability of the NIEM concept and the relevance of its implementation on a full scale.

The quality of the results obtained by the NIEM members is such that it is strongly recommended that the inputs should be published in international journals.

Prospects for achieving long-term objectives:

Achievement of the long-term objectives are expected within a shorter time span than originally envisaged because of the success of the first phase. In most of the countries of the region, there is a growing awareness of the need for enhancing the environmental management capabilities of environmental agencies and industry and for promoting technical co-operation, sharing of expertise and 'know-how' and training activities.

UNEP's inputs to the project:

UNEP/ROAP made substantial technical inputs, co-ordinated all the activities and monitored the progress of implementation. ROAP thus provided necessary stimulus for effective networking among the participating institutions.

Effect of the project:

The project will be instrumental in stimulating an increased financial commitment by Governments and industry for environmentally sound industrial management. It will also enhance the indigenous capabilities of co-operating countries through the training programmes that would use the manuals and other materials, thus also promoting the concept of TCDC.

Lessons learnt from the project:

Since most of the countries face financial constraints, UNEP has to play its unique catalytic role and provide intellectual leadership so that the countries will give the required administrative support. UNEP must also generate a spirit of enthusiasm among network partners by making them aware of the benefits that would accrue to them through the networking mechanism. Constant follow-up is necessary to sustain the momentum generated.

Recommendations:

In order to further improve co-ordination and co-operation amongst NIEM members and get their full involvement, it is necessary to arrange visits by project co-ordinators to other field study locations, provide timely consultancy services by high-ranking consultants, as well as increased financial provision for field studies. There is also a need to arrange for the wider dissemination of outputs so that more institutions will be motivated to join the Network.

/...

III. SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF EDUCATION, PUBLIC AWARENESS AND INFORMATION PROJECTS

In-depth Evaluation

Title: INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMME (IEEP)/PHASE V FP/3101-86-01 (2668) AND PHASE VI FP/3101-88-01 (2809)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation/Co-operating Agency: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (Unesco)

Scope: Global

Duration: Phase V: 15 May 1986 - 31 December 1987
Phase VI: 1 January 1988 - 31 December 1989

Cost:

		Expressed in US$	%
Phase V	To UNEP	840,033	35
	To Unesco	946,600	37
	Other	700,000	28
	Total	2,486,633	100
Phase VI	to UNEP	1,510,000	51
	to UNESCO	1,400,000	49
	Total	2,910,000	100
Phases V & VI	Grand total	5,396,633	

Objectives:

Short-term objective (Phase V)

To encourage and assist at least 10 Member States, and at least six national and regional institutions selectively to develop the staff and resources necessary for environmental education at the primary and secondary school and university levels, technical and vocational education, as well as education of the general public; and to promote adaptation and use of environmental education materials developed under earlier phases of IEEP in all regions and countries.

Short-term objective (Phase VI)

To encourage and assist selected national and regional institutions in at least 15 developing Member States to develop staff and other resources necessary for promoting environmental education at the primary and secondary school levels, universities, technical and vocational institutes, as well as for the general public; to promote adaptation and use of environmental education materials developed under earlier phases of IEEP in countries and regions and therefore bring to a total of 60 (45 + 15) the number of developing countries that have incorporated an environmental dimension into their educational systems.

Long-term objective

Incorporation of environmental education into the educational systems, programmes and procedures of selected governments and national institutions.

II. BACKGROUND

In 1975 Unesco and UNEP launched 7 IEEP. During its 13-year span, there has been considerable progress in the field of environmental education. The results of the programme have been the development of a general awareness of the necessity for environmental education, development of concepts and methodological approaches in this field and initial efforts to incorporate an environmental dimension into the educational processes of Member States.

During its first phase (1975-1977), the main thrust of IEEP was the development of general awareness for environmental education. The second phase of IEEP (1977-1981) was devoted mainly to conceptual and methodological clarification, as well as to the incorporation of an environmental dimension into the educational systems of Member States. The third phase of IEEP (1982-1984) emphasized the development of content, methods and materials for environmental education practices and training activities; experimental and pilot projects were intensified. Phase IV of IEEP (1986) was more practical and field-oriented and included elements for the preparation of substantive orientation and identification of institutions active in the field of environmental education and training, production of experimental materials, training of personnel, preparation and adaptation of educational materials and their dissemination.

During Phase V (1986-1987), emphasis has been placed on encouraging and assisting Member States to develop the staff and other resources necessary for conducting environmental education in the formal and non-formal sectors. In addition, IEEP developed a series of pilot projects. Environmental education information was disseminated through printed documents and eight issues of Connect, the IEEP newsletter.

Phase VI (1988 onwards) concentrates on continued assistance to institutions at the national and regional level in developing staff and other resources for environmental education. The project is also promoting the adaptation of environmental education materials developed during earlier phases of the programme. Another major thrust is the continued increase in the number of developing countries that have incorporated environmental education into their educational systems.

/...

In 1984 an in-depth evaluation on the IEEP was conducted (see Evaluation Report 1985). The present evaluation was conducted in October 1988, at the mid-point of the current phase, partly to see how the recommendations of the first evaluation had been implemented and partly to review the development of IEEP thus far.

Two external evaluators conducted the evaluation on behalf of both Unesco and UNEP. The main conclusions and recommendations are presented below, based for the most part on the detailed evaluation report that was copied to both organizations. In this particular case, the UNEP format for the evaluation report was not followed.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the programme

There is no doubt that the programme is relevant. Throughout its life, it has filled an important need. Now that there is a current of support in favour of environmental education in many parts of the world, IEEP is ever more relevant. The World Commission on Environment and Development, the 1987 Environmental Education Conference at Moscow and other major forums have advised Governments to review their policies to make environmental issues an integral part of educational and professional training.

IEEP's relevance is now conditioned by its ability to seize the opportunity represented by this interest, and respond to these calls, as well as by its ability to adapt to the changing climate in which it operates.

In some places the evidence of changing attitudes is striking, affecting government policies and public perceptions alike. There is an increasing diversity of environmental educational programmes in both the formal and non-formal sectors. IEEP has helped to bring these changes about and must now continue to adapt in the face of changing situations if it is to remain relevant.

2. Appropriateness of programme design

On the whole, the design of the programme has been sufficiently appropriate, changing emphasis as situations have changed. Perhaps one flaw in the programme could be ascribed to the fact that there has not been enough emphasis on influencing national educational policy in order to create a supportive overall environment in which the other activities of IEEP could develop and prosper.

3. The country situation: efficiency, effectiveness and impact of IEEP

Ten country reports were prepared covering different regions to give a balanced view of IEEP functioning. Three countries were visited in Africa (Kenya, Malawi and Senegal), two in Asia (India and Thailand), two in Europe (Denmark and Hungary), two in Latin America and the Caribbean (Jamaica and Venezuela), and one in the Middle East (Bahrain). Several issues were examined in each country, including the link between environment and education, the level of consciousness of the importance of environmental education, the research and activities undertaken, training needs, training of personnel, exchange of information and experience and the preparation of educational materials.

/...

It is very difficult to distinguish those activities and impacts that can be directly ascribed to the IEEP and those that derive from the general development of environmental education in the country. This in itself is not a problem because the influence of IEEP has been in its role as an initiator, catalyst, supporter and sustainer of the wave of enthusiasm for environmental education that was encountered in many of the countries. IEEP work, while not readily identifiable in all cases, has spread its influence and blended with national activities. Even where no impacts of IEEP are directly visible, the fact of its presence and the international influence of its activities give credibility and strength to national and local programmes. In this respect, it is clear that the impact of the programme on specific activities at a country level has been positive.

4. The main activities of IEEP: efficiency, effectiveness and impact

Various aspects of the programme were examined. Exchange of information and experience has worked very well and is one of the most appreciated aspects of the programme in that it gives users access to a broad spectrum of information. Meetings have also had long-term impact. In this sense, because of their far-reaching effects, they are more cost-effective than might seem the case initially.

The newsletter Connect and the other publications emanating from the programme, such as the directories of organizations and projects have been useful. This could indicate a flaw in the mode of distribution, coupled perhaps to the media used.

Research and experimentation were not much in evidence, particularly the former. Some IEEP influence can be detected in experimentation and in the adaptation of training materials and curricula, some of which benefited from IEEP models. This is heartening evidence both of concern at the government level and the usefulness of the programme.

Training of personnel and the development of educational material and publications has worked fairly well, but has perhaps not taken sufficient account of local realities in the direct actions undertaken by IEEP.

It is difficult to ascertain the exact impact of each of the programme components, but one can conclude that overall, IEEP represents a considerable volume of worthy efforts, reasonably distributed geographic coverage and in the main, successful. It was not possible, however, to make a rigorous statistical review, as it is extremely difficult to untangle the direct effects of the programme from wholly independent national efforts.

5. Catalytic role of UNEP and the role of Unesco

It is not possible to ascribe a preponderantly catalytic role to UNEP because the programme is a result of equal contributions from both partners. While in the past, there may have been some problems, it is abundantly clear that the co-operative relations between Unesco and UNEP have improved significantly in the last few years. The creation of the Inter-Secretariat IEEP Steering Committee (ISC) has been instrumental in this improvement; it has proved to be an excellent instrument for co-operation and development of IEEP and has succeeded in establishing and sustaining the spirit of co-operation between the two organizations.

/...

However, it is of some concern that there remain people involved in environmental education work who do not know of the existence of IEEP.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Overall one can conclude that the programme has been successful and has contributed to strengthening activities at regional, subregional and national levels in the areas in which it has worked. Perhaps more emphasis could have been placed on influencing national policies, and on providing a more propitious framework wherein the programme could develop and prosper.

Specific recommendations can be made on how to improve the major components of the programme, namely the following:

(i) Environmental education could be strengthened by developing a programme comparable to a primary health care programme. The concepts, methodologies and the implications of an interdisciplinary approach should be promoted further through concise and authoritative publications;

(ii) Training should be stimulated with the main focus on countries producing their own educational materials and running their own seminars and training workshops. Support could be given by 'travelling seminars', rather than depending on large international workshops to disseminate ideas;

(iii) Publications should be further strengthened by finding supplementary distribution channels and new modes of presenting the information they contain, among these new audio-visual and computer-based media. It would also be useful to develop specialized material on certain subjects;

(iv) More emphasis should be placed on a strategic approach for influencing national educational policies and strategies so as to provide a receptive framework for environmental educational activities undertaken by the Programme. It would also be advisable to develop a clearer methodology for strengthening national policy.

/...

In-depth Evaluation

Title: DIRECTORIES OF MARINE SCIENCE INSTITUTES AND BIBLIOGRAPHIES OF MARINE POLLUTION
FP/0501-82-02; FP/5101-82-02; FP/5102-84-06

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Co-operating agency, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) in association with Unesco and the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN)

Scope: Global

Duration: July 1982 - March 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	468,688	65
To FAO	250,800	35
Total	719,488	100

Objectives:

As reformulated in June 1988

Short-term objectives

(i) Promotion of the exchange and flow of information, through the publication of directories and bibliographies, at the regional, interregional and international levels;

(ii) Achievement of Goal 5 of UNEP's medium-term plan (1990-1995): Establishment of an operational, globally co-ordinated system for monitoring the changes in the quality of the marine and coastal environment.

Long-term objective

Enhancement of the availability of data on pollution and management aspects of the marine and coastal environment to decision/policy makers, scientists and scientific institutions which would serve as a source of basic information for more efficient planning and co-ordination of pollution assessment and related management work within the framework of national, regional, interregional and international programmes.

/...

II. BACKGROUND

The project was approved as a joint undertaking of UNEP and FAO to institutionalize previous informal arrangements for publishing information on issues related to the marine environment. The present endeavour was a natural follow-up to other similar work carried out by FAO and UNEP in the past, in the field of information on the marine environment. By 1982, UNEP had already published seven directories, one of which had been produced in collaboration with FAO. FAO had also published five bibliographies on marine pollution, four of which had been done in collaboration with, or with the support of UNEP.

The project should be seen in the broader framework of the United Nations system of information on marine issues, the Aquatic Sciences and Fisheries Information System (ASFIS), a co-operative international information system created in 1975 and supported and maintained by several United Nations agencies (with FAO as the manager) and a network of national information centres. UNEP in 1975 supported the creation of ASFIS through two projects "Environmental Activities Data (FP/0900-75-01)" and "Accelerated Development of ASFIS (FP/1302-75-01)". The Aquatic Sciences and Fisheries Abstracts (ASFA), created in 1971, was subsequently incorporated into ASFIS.

The project, after more than six years of activities, has been closed. Following the recent practice in the Ocean and Coastal Areas Programme Activity Centre (OCA/PAC) to prepare formal evaluations of major long-term projects, the project was evaluated in March 1989. Activities have now been transferred to UNEP headquarters, as part of the drive to build a consolidated computer searchable data-base on organizations, institutions and experts involved in UNEP-sponsored programmes.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the project

The project objectives were, and continue to be, highly relevant, particularly for the UNEP Regional Seas Programme. Making information on the marine and coastal environment widely available is undoubtedly an effective way of contributing to improved planning and management in that area. Doing this through publications is a logical option, although consideration of other media would have made the short-term objectives of the project more congruent with the overall long-term aims.

2. Appropriateness of the design of the project

Some aspects of the design of the project were not wholly appropriate, although, in the later stages of the project, there were attempts to correct this. Among the shortcomings is the failure to recognize the need to build a dynamic information system that could evolve over time, as well as a somewhat constricted institutional framework that did not take advantage of the benefits of participating in larger international information systems, such as ASFIS. Failure to take fully into account the technical implications and requirements of building a good information system, weighing the relative merits of a computerized, searchable data base and the production of hard copy was another important flaw in the project design. Minor problems also include the somewhat poor presentation of the project, including a time-frame which was clearly inconsistent with the nature of the endeavour and a poorly developed work plan, which was reactive to circumstances rather than one which provided an orderly progression to building up information.

3. Effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation

The implementation of the project was characterized by an uneven flow of activities with periods of high productivity and periods of stasis. This was due mainly to organizational and personnel problems, which brought the project almost to a standstill at times and in part to the narrow time-frame of the initial project design, which necessitated continuous revisions and extensions.

The institutional arrangements with FAO, while having undeniable potential for providing an experienced and well-supported infrastructure, were flawed; the actual support provided was not commensurate with the requirements of the project. This was complicated by the constant flow of communication and consultation between FAO and UNEP, which inevitably slowed action.

Not having project personnel on a continuous basis was a recurring problem; but the dedication and enthusiasm of the staff that was in place at various times was the crucial factor in overcoming difficulties and has contributed to the positive results produced by the project.

Finally, the methods used to collect and update information were cumbersome and contributed to the delays in their production. On the other hand, the efficiency of the publication and distribution process itself was fairly good.

In general terms, the financial status of the project has been satisfactory in terms of cost-effectiveness of the products. If the funds spent seem rather high in absolute terms, it is because building up a data base is always costly in its initial phases. The management of the funds, while correct, was perhaps less satisfactory in terms of scheduling and follow-up on the part of UNEP.

In respect of the outputs, the printed format chosen for them was unnecessarily limited and it would have been very useful if on-line computer access had been developed as well. However, the quality and quantity of the outputs produced by the project are very high. A distinction should be made between the directories, on the one hand, which are without question of high quality and respond well to the uses for which they were intended, and on the other hand, the bibliographies, which are perhaps of a lesser quality in terms of presentation and, for the most part, are too general in subject coverage to be truly useful. This said, the publications have proved to be a valuable service, particularly to developing countries.

4. Impact of the project

The overall impact of the project appears to be positive, inasmuch as the objective of providing information that could be widely used, was realized. Requests for the publications have been numerous and indicate widespread use, particularly within the UNEP Regional Seas Programme. Whether the information provided has supported better planning and management, as well as more efficient research, is difficult to establish in the absence of a field survey.

/...

5. Catalytic role of UNEP and the role of the partners

There was little attempt on the part of UNEP to exercise a catalytic influence through the project, mobilizing and inspiring its partners to take on the responsibility eventually, or at least become full partners in the information system.

The role of FAO was somewhat passive, being reduced to servicing the project without making too much of a substantive contribution. Other partners, such as Unesco and IUCN made good substantive contributions, probably because the publications were directly within their own area of interest.

6. Unanticipated effects

No major unanticipated effects occurred. However, the importance that full computerization of the information system would acquire with time could and should have been foreseen.

IV. MEETING PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The short-term objectives of the project are successfully being met, considering that this is an ongoing endeavour, with 25 publications already issued and six more nearing publication.

The long-term objective is a continuing process, to which meeting the short-term objectives contributes.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has been very positive, fulfilling its stated objectives and producing a considerable volume of publications, which have been widely distributed and widely requested by numerous independent sources. Although some problems were encountered in the conception of the project, particularly from the technical point of view, as well as in its execution, these in no way invalidate the very real achievements.

The following recommendations can be made:

1. Specific recommendations

Now that the project has been moved to Headquarters, UNEP should:

(i) Give a broader scope to the project, by placing it within a broader institutional framework such as ASFIS, by strengthening collaboration with other partners and by giving a wider information coverage;

(ii) Institutionalize the project on a long-term basis;

(iii) Rationalize and decentralize the collection of data, taking advantage of the Regional Seas network of institutions;

/...

(iv) Computerize the system totally, thus providing greater flexibility and ease of access to the information;

(v) Provide a dual system of information dissemination, providing the broadest possible access, namely by hard-cover publications and an on-line computer data base.

2. General recommendations

General lessons can be drawn from the evaluation that can apply to a broad range of endeavours:

(i) Project formulation should be more realistic, the time frame should be congruent with the nature of the endeavour; the institutional arrangements should be realistic in terms of the capability of the organizations involved and flexible enough to allow a timely response to changing institutions; staff responsibilities should be clearly defined before the project begins and should be governed by flexible mechanisms; and the work plan should be clearly delineated, so as to ensure a progressive building up of results;

(ii) UNEP's collaboration with other agencies should be governed by a greater spirit of mutual support and trust. General lines of work should be agreed at the start, thus relieving all parties of the need for continued communication and checks of an administrative nature that serve only to slow progress;

(iii) UNEP should take its catalytic role more seriously when working with other organizations, bearing in mind that this role calls for a broader vision than simply "getting a (specific) job done", but rather, should entail setting in motion processes that will then be carried out independently by all those interested.

In-depth Evaluation

Title: SUPPORT TO THE TELEVISION TRUST FOR THE ENVIRONMENT (TVE) FP/9101-86-03 (2684)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Television Trust for the Environment (TVE), UK

Scope: Global

Duration: June 1986 - December 1989

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	846,530	12
Other counterpart	5,793,236	83
TVE	356,220	5
Total	6,995,986	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) Increased recognition among film, video and radio producers of UNEP's role as the principal global source of authoritative information on Earth's key environmental issues;

(ii) Stimulation of the production and broadcast of an increasing number of audio-visual programmes on environmental issues and criteria for sustainable development;

(iii) Increased distribution and dissemination of audio-visual programmes world-wide and in developing countries in particular in order to enhance awareness of particular environmental problems;

(iv) Increased use of audio-visual media in environmental assessment management;

(v) Increased dissemination of information and education material to young people and semi-literate adults through a global network.

Long-term objectives

(i) To promote environmentally responsible decision-making at all levels in society; and

(ii) To strengthen UNEP's identity and public recognition of its catalytic role as the global organization concerned with the environment.

/...

II. BACKGROUND

In 1984, UNEP and Central Television, the United Kingdom's leading indepedent company, joined forces to create TVE - the international Television Trust for the Environment - to help ensure that the public should have access to accurate information to encourage responsible decision-making, particularly in respect of environmental issues.

TVE was established to exploit the expansion in visual communications in the developed and in the developing world. It was designed to be the intermediary between broadcasters and environmentalists on the one hand and development organizations on the other - responsive to the needs and expertise available to all three.

The manner in which TVE operates is novel. It stimulates and sells ideas for and approaches to new media projects and promotes the finished products, thus acting primarily as an 'enabler', drawing on the resources and skills of a wide range of environmentally concerned organizations. To do this, it has access to the practical support of a distinguished panel of international figures, the Board of Trustees, which represent a broad range of business, television and environmental expertise and sets policy. TVE has maintained a small core staff and contracts all other services as required.

In addition to arranging for the production and showing of audio-visual material on the environment, TVE provides a series of other specific services: Moving Pictures, a pilot project to distribute programmes to developing countries at subsidized rates; the quarterly Moving Pictures Bulletin, presenting reviews on environmental audio-visual productions (a special edition for developing countries, Third Eye, as well as a French language version also exist); the publication Switching on to the Environment, a guide to more than 100 outstanding films on environmental issues; a thematic data-base which has more than 1000 titles, available through the Green Net computer link-up; the NGO Video Distribution Service, which answers NGO requests for films, supported by modest grants; the Outreach programme, a network for environment and health awareness teaching and training in developing countries.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Relevance of the project

Public pressure and concern is a crucial factor in bringing about responsible decision-making on environmental issues. Environmental institutions can provide accurate information, but can reach only a small proportion of the public. The media, on the other hand, can reach a vast audience, but up to now have not shown much initiative in presenting environmental issues in an appealing and informative manner.

Creating a link between these two sources of information for the public is much needed and TVE helps to answer that need. In this sense, the project can be considered to be highly relevant and timely.

/...

2. Appropriateness of the project design

A degree of the success of the project can be attributed to the unconstraining nature of the project design, which allows a considerable degree of flexibility. UNEP has been experimenting with an 'umbrella' type project format that can be easily updated as circumstances require, and new activities can be added with a minimum degree of complication. The present project is one of the best examples of this approach. It has been able to accommodate the growth in activities of TVE, leaving it a great degree of freedom to explore the most promising avenues to carry out its task.

An agreement was reached between UNEP and TVE from the very beginning that TVE would retain total editorial independence and would concentrate on promoting the issues involved, rather than serving as a public relations arm for UNEP, or for that matter, any other institution.

As TVE has grown, it has been able to attract support from other agencies, but has retained its independence and has continued to concentrate on the media aspects and the quality and interest of its production.

3. Efficiency of the project implementation

TVE has been particularly efficient in developing its programme and has devised novel ways to infiltrate the media with the environmental message. Not only has it been quick to respond to new opportunities in visual technologies; it has also developed creative ways of making use of opportunities which were not foreseen when the project was first developed.

One factor which has contributed to the efficiency of TVE's work is that it has concentrated action on four major topics - atmosphere, ecosystems, water and hazardous chemicals. This scoping has allowed it to be more effective in its chosen fields than if it had opted for covering the entire range of environmental issues.

The mode in which the TVE operates is also very efficient. Its typical approach is conceived as a cycle that repeats itself in a ripple effect, with ever widening influence. This approach makes the best use of available personnel and funds and uses a variety of media, all of which generates spinoffs that then acquire a life of their own.

TVE starts the process by raising funds from various sources to produce a film; it conducts research on the project site and invites a major television company to join; it produces the broadcast version and completes it with educational backup material. Separate versions are produced, together with the appropriate educational package, that will answer the needs of different groups of viewers. TVE distributes the programmes free of charge to selected TVE stations in developing countries, while developed country networks buy the programmes. New proposals are made to continue TVE's involvement with the issue, thus starting another cycle.

A very efficient way of generating an additional financial base has been to negotiate co-productions and mobilize co-financing of activities. TVE has also taken some risks by providing funding to independent producers, mainly in developing countries, who can operate with small sums. This has paid off handsomely and has proven very effective.

4. Effectiveness and impact of the project

TVE and associated productions have been very effective in transmitting the environmental message to wide audiences in a informative and powerful manner. They have also had a measurable impact on decision-making circles.

Just to give an illustration of the success of TVE productions, we can cite the fact that the artistic merit and communicating power of the films produced by TVE sponsored productions has been recognized by the awarding of major prizes among which are "Emmy", Peabody, Bafta, New York Film and TV Gold Medal, three Geneva North/South Awards, Prix Italia, Royal Television Society, Ecovision, Ekofilm and Riena FR3.

The films produced by TVE co-producers have been seen one or more times in approximately 90 countries, reaching audiences of millions of people. The potential impact of this is enormous. Four films that have made a significant difference in public and political opinion give some idea of the potential for change that reaching large audiences can have: Seeds of Dispair, one of the first films made by TVE, was the starting point for the UK Ethiopian famine appeal. The Crowded Desert prompted a debate on Indian television on the menace posed by desertification. The Acid Test was shown to delegates at the European transboundary air pollution meeting and alerted them in a very vivid manner to the implications of the subject they were discussing. Decade of Destruction was submitted as evidence by environmental NGOs at United States Congressional hearings on the World Bank, and has contributed in part to changing perceptions on the negative impacts that development can cause and as a consequence, the changing policy of the Bank. It is quite clear that all these films have contributed in no small measure to raising awareness in wide publics, as well as to contributing to policy changes.

From this evidence, one can say with confidence that the achievements of TVE today have been considerable and their impact extensive.

5. Catalytic role of UNEP and the role of the other partners

Through TVE, UNEP has been able to achieve a truly catalytic effect. UNEP's funding for the preparation of TVE programmes attracted funding from other sources at the rate of 1:8. This has permitted the production of more films and reaching an ever-growing audience.

The obvious quality of the products and their positive effects has attracted an ever-growing number of partners. More than 40 organizations or entities have become associated with TVE since its foundation. These include not only United Nations organizations (Habitat, Unicef, United Nations Development Programme, Unesco, World Food Programme, International Fund for Agricultural Development), but bilateral aid organizations (Canadian International Development Agency, United Kingdom Overseas Development Agency, Norwegian Agency for International Development, Swedish International Development Authority and others). Important intergovernmental bodies such as European Economic Community have also been involved. Other associates include universities, foundations and NGOs, both major and small. Along different lines, TVE works in association with major broadcasting corporations, in developed countries,as well as small independent producers in developing countries.

/...

One must conclude that the creation of TVE is a particularly impressive example of what catalysis can accomplish, and that UNEP judged wisely when it decided to support this somewhat unorthodox venture.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

We can conclude from examining the evidence that TVE has evolved into a powerful media agent that has been able to influence not only the public in a great number of countries, making them more aware of the power that ordinary citizens have in changing environmental conditions, but has also been able to make an impact on decision makers, pointing the way towards specific action.

The impressive way in which TVE has been able to extend its activities starting from modest beginnings shows that it has been able to fill an important gap.

Finally, the way in which TVE operates is a unique example of how catalysis can work effectively, and is probably one of UNEP's most important successes in this area of its mandate.

It is recommended that UNEP take this example of catalytic action as a model, replicating it in other spheres.

Desk evaluation

Title: ENVIRONMENT AND MILITARY ACTIVITY - PHASE II: "CULTURAL NORMS IN RELATION TO WAR AND THE ENVIRONMENT" FP/RA/8101-86-01 (2647)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Supporting Organization: Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI), Sweden

Scope: Global

Duration: 1 July 1986 - 31 December 1987

Cost	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	167,855	53
To SIPRI	146,600	47
Total	314,455	100

Objectives:

Short-term objective

To engender a greater awareness among key individuals, institutions and organizations that have the potential to influence public opinion and government decisions concerning:

(i) The links between natural resource limitation/environmental degradation and conflicts and international security perceptions;

(ii) The ethical basis in existing cultural attitudes for the protection of the natural environment from the degrading and destructive potential of modern warfare, and of the arms race.

Long-term objective

(i) To secure a widespread understanding among the general public and decision makers of (a) the linkages between environment and the arms race in all the dimensions of military preparations and (b) of the actions by which Governments can be persuaded to make efforts to preserve and enhance the environment, as well as to maintain international security;

(ii) To secure the political will of Governments in promoting legal, institutional, economic and other measures to halt and reverse the arms race and to reduce the risk of armed conflict.

/...

II. BACKGROUND

Military activity not only causes environmental disruption and wasteful use of natural resources; it also diverts resources away from economic and social development and from environmental protection.

In an effort to publicize the adverse efforts of military activity and the arms race, UNEP has collaborated with SIPRI in a series of studies analyzing diverse aspects of the issue.

Phase I "Environment and Military Activity" (FP/RA/8101-83-01) undertaken between 1983 and 1986, led to the publication of various books - "Environmental Warfare: A Technical, Legal and Policy Appraisal" (August 1984); "Herbicides in War: The Long-Term Ecological and Human Consequences" (September 1984); "Explosive Remnants of War: Mitigating the Environmental Effects" (September 1985); "Global Resources and International Conflict: Environmental Factors in Strategic Policy and Action" (June 1986).

In addition, through that project, UNEP contributed to the World Disarmament Campaign by providing material summarizing the major policy findings and recommendations of the studies for use in a public information campaign.

The present project has resulted in the publication of Cultural Norms in Relation to War and the Environment, which is under review here. Other products of the project include: an annotated bibliography Threat of Modern Warfare to Man and his Environment; the outline of a book on the environmental consequences of the regional conflict in Iran and Iraq; minor reports and articles; and a paper entitled "Disarmament, Environment and Sustainable Development: a time for action".

The book was published by Oxford University Press in 1988, with a print run of 2,600 copies, of which 1,000 were distributed with a questionnaire. To date, only 17 replies have been received, but this was deemed enough to do a reasonably accurate evaluation.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Profile of the readers

Almost all the respondents were from developed countries, which perhaps indicates that the topic is considered more relevant in the North. Of these respondents, 35 per cent were involved in international relations or political affairs and 17 per cent were subject specialists. This indicates that a majority were directly connected in some way to the subject of the book. Twenty-four per cent of the respondents indicated they were journalists and 12 per cent each were in academia and libraries.

Over 85 per cent indicated that the book had been received directly from SIPRI. It is interesting to note that none of those who responded had received the book from UNEP.

Slightly more than half of the respondents indicated that their copy would be accessible to others, which will ensure a wider dissemination of the book.

/...

2. Assessment of the quality of the book

The book addressed several issues in respect of objectivity of treatment and presentation of the facts; 69 per cent of the respondents termed "very good" while the rest found it "adequate". It should be noted that one respondent stated that the treatment manifested an idealogical bias. Opinions on the rigour of analysis were somewhat more varied: 50 per cent of the respondents considered it very high, while 31 per cent termed it adequate, 13 per cent termed it poor and a surprising 6 per cent could not judge. In respect of the coverage of the topic, 41 per cent of the respondents deemed it very good, 53 per cent deemed it adequate while 13 per cent thought it was poor. The main reason for this was apparently the unevenness of the treatment of the different sections. In respect of the topicality of the subject matter, 65 per cent of the respondents deemed it very good, 29 per cent termed it only adequate and 6 per cent thought it poor, as the subject was considered somewhat marginal. In respect of the readability, 53 per cent of the respondents rated it as very good, 27 per cent thought it adequate and 6 per cent thought it poor. In fact, several of the respondents noted that the style varied considerably from one article to another, making the book uneven reading. In terms of the organization of the subject, the opinions were divided equally in its being rated very good and adequate. In terms of presentation, 67 per cent considered it very good, while the remainder considered it adequate.

These results indicate a fairly high degree of satisfaction with the quality of the book, although it should be pointed out that a few of the respondents thought that this book was less satisfying than the others in the series.

3. Usefulness of the book

In terms of the usefulness of the book in the work of the respondents, 47 per cent termed it very useful, 47 per cent said it might be partially useful, while 12 per cent stated that it would be of little use in their work. In terms of the technical and substantive value of the book for their work, 24 per cent stated that it was high, a majority, 52 per cent, said it was of moderate value, while the balance was of the opinion that it was of little value. Half the respondents indicated that the book would be relevant to their work, while a full 29 per cent stated that it was of little relevance. The majority, 65 per cent, indicated that a good part of the material was new to them. Finally, the respondents indicated that the publications would be used to a considerable degree in only 20 per cent of cases, moderately in 65 per cent of cases and only a little or not at all in 40 per cent of cases. The most common reasons given for the book's contributing to the respondents' work was that it was instrumental in explaining novel issues or that it contained useful background material.

It is not clear whether these results are a reflection of the actual interests of the respondents, or whether the questions were poorly framed, giving the impression that they referred to direct and immediate usefulness.

/...

4. Suggestions for improvements

About half of the respondents indicated that better editing would have made the book more readable. Others suggested that a broader perspective, showing how the issue related to economics, poverty, and underdevelopment would have made the book more relevant. Still others suggested that greater thoroughness in the review of the issues, as well as the inclusion of more data on the Soviet position, would have given the book better balance. Finally, one respondent suggested that perhaps a paperback edition with a somewhat simpler presentation could play an important role in making the material more accessible to a wider public.

IV. MEETING OF THE PROJECT OBJECTIVES

In respect of achieving the short-term objectives, there is some degree of success. While it is probable that the book is contributing to engendering a greater awareness of the issue among interested parties, it is not clear whether key individuals, i.e. politicians, are being reached. As for the long-term objectives, their achievement is an on-going process and it is too early to expect results.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

On the whole, the book has been well received, although there is a consensus that of all the books prepared by SIPRI with the support of UNEP on environment and military activities, this is the least satisfying. The real question is whether the objectives that were set for the project were realistic. Books of this nature are of interest largely to academics working in this particualr field. However, it is largely through public pressure that changes in government policy take place, and the book has not reached this wide public. One can conclude that while the book has undoubtedly made a contribution to the analysis of the issues, a vehicle of this nature cannot make much difference in public opinion.

It is recommended that UNEP endeavour to tailor the medium to its content and objectives more carefully. UNEP should not fix unreasonable objectives to projects, such as expecting a single publication to act as agents for change.

In this particular case, UNEP should try to disseminate the message contained in the book to a much wider audience. Several avenues should be explored, including the production of a popular paperback edition or a series of judiciously placed articles and audio-visual programmes in the media.

Desk Evaluation

Title: SUPPORT TO THE PRODUCTION OF THE WORLD RESOURCES REPORT (WRR), 1989 (Vol. 3) - FP/9101-87-91 (2786)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Supporting organization: World Resources Institute (WRI) in association with International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED)

Scope: Global

Duration: 1 September 1987 - 31 December 1988

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To the UNEP	400,000	48
To WRI	434,295	52
Total	834,295	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) To make available to policy-makers the most up-to-date analyses and data on global conditions and trends in natural resources by preparation of a third volume of WRR, World Resources 1988-1989;

(ii) Improved co-ordination of the content and focus of WRR with the State-of-the-Environment Report, the reports of the Executive Director and other relevant reports of UNEP, in order to meet the diverse needs for our combined audiences.

Long-term objective

Improved decision-making with respect to the management of natural resources, the implementation of strategies for sustainable development, and the protection of environmental quality throughout the world, by providing a continuing, convenient source of objective analyses and accurate, up-to-date information to policy-makers and other individuals and organizations concerned with these issues. Improvement in the quality, completeness, and availability of critical data sets by identifying important information needs and problems in existing data.

II. BACKGROUND

WRR is a report series produced by the WRI and IIED. The Report provides a global assessment of natural resources and the environment and their relationship to economic development. WRR provides analyses of global environmental conditions and trends, together with up-to-date information on natural resources in 146 countries. It is intended for an audience of policy-makers in governmental and non-governmental organizations, academics, the media, and interested individuals.

/...

The first two volumes in the series, World Resources 1986 and World Resources 1987, were produced independently with financial support from UNEP and other organizations. The first volume in the series, World Resources 1986, was highly acclaimed by policy-makers, academics, and the press. The initial print run in English (15,000 paperback) was sold out. In addition, editions of World Resources 1986 in Arabic, Chinese and German are in preparation. World Resources 1987 was published early in 1987. For this second volume, in addition to Arabic, Chinese, English, and German editions, WRI and IIED are planning editions in French, Japanese, Russian, and Spanish.

The present project financed the preparation of an English version of World Resources 1988-1989, with limited distribution of approximately 15,000 copies, primarily through commercial sales. UNEP has distributed approximately 600 copies to date, together with questionnaires, so that the reception of the report could be evaluated. The results, based upon a sample of questionnaires are presented below.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Response to the questionnaires

Approximately six hundred questionnaires were distributed and, as at May 1989, only 30 had been returned. This is half a per cent point response rate, which is quite low, but has been deemed sufficient to present useful indications.

The professional background of the respondents was overwhelmingly governmental and academic: 55 per cent were civil servants, either in Governments or international organizations, and 41 per cent were affiliated to universities or research institutions and the balance in various other categories. Two thirds of the respondents were from developed countries.

2. Assessment of quality and other aspects of the publication

The publication was very well received, with a significant majority qualifying it as very good. The breakdown is as follows: 86 per cent deemed the objectivity of the publication very good, 62 per cent deemed the analysis very good and 68 per cent deemed the subject coverage very good. In terms of the presentation of the material, 82 per cent judged the report very good for readability, 78 per cent thought the organization of material was good and 92 per cent thought the presentation was very good.

In terms of the usefulness of the publication, its technical value to the user was considered high by 50 per cent of the sample and average by 43 per cent. The relevance of the publication to their work was considered high by 50 per cent and average by 46 per cent of the readers.

Thirty-one per cent of the respondents stated that they were generally familiar with the material, and 35 per cent expected that most of the information would be useful to them in their work. Forty-six per cent said they would use the publication as a reference work, while a further 26 per cent indicated that they would also find immediate and specific use for it. Eighty-three per cent of the respondents said they shared their copy with other individuals, varying from 2 to 25 persons per copy.

3. Suggestions for improvements and additions

The respondents suggested improvements and additions. In the great majority of cases, they called for more data (24%) and a deeper analysis (41%) of existing material. In addition, readers appeared to want expanded information. The most frequent topics mentioned were international treaties and basic economic indicators. Other topics included more regional data and more details, particularly in the form of maps and charts.

4. In-depth review

An in-depth review was conducted by one of the readers, working in a managerial-level programme position in an international environmental organization. The reviewer judged the publication as extremely useful, in fact terming it a basic reference work that presented not only interesting data, but useful analysis and guidance in different areas. Few errors or deficiencies were noted.

IV. MEETING OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The short-term objectives were fully met and have directly contributed to the meeting of the long-term objectives which are an on-going endeavour.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

It is quite clear that the publication is of high quality and has been well received by a broad spectrum of individuals. UNEP has supported a worthwhile endeavor and it is recommended that it continue to do so in the future, at least until 1992, at which time an in-depth evaluation should be undertaken to help determine the future course of action.

Desk Evaluation

Title: "MAN AND THE ATMOSPHERE: CLIMATE CHANGE, OZONE LAYER", a publication of INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION SYSTEM (INFOTERRA) PROGRAMME ACTIVITY CENTRE - PHASE VII - FP/3104-86-01

I. PROJECT DATA (for INFOTERRA/PAC as a whole)

Implementation: Direct

Scope: Global

Duration: 1 January 1986 - 31 December 1989

Cost: 1/

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	3,404,991	94
To Government of Australia (cash)	5,188	1
to USSR (cash/kind)	190,500	5
Total	3,600,679	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

To develop further and improve the operation of INFOTERRA at the national and international levels, and contribute to the attainment of the targets for the year 1990 through:

(i) The activation of at least 15 inactive national focal points;

(ii) The extension of the network of environmental information sources from the present 5,213 to 6,000 sources from 75 countries;

(iii) The extension of the network of Special Sectoral Sources from 9 to 24;

(iv) The increase of the number of Regional Service Centres from 3 to 8.

Long-term objective

Better decision-making on environmental assessment and management issues through the increased availability of relevant information to decision makers, planners and others requiring it.

1/ The cost given covers all the activities of INFOTERRA over four years.

II. BACKGROUND

The INFOTERRA Programme Activity Centre (INFOTERRA/PAC) projects are designed to support the functioning of the INFOTERRA System. The present project is a contribution of other similar projects, namely FP/0900-72-01(434) - Plans for the Pilot Phase of IRS; FP/0900-73-01(338) - Planning Pilot Phase of IRS; FP/0900-73-02(295) - IRS Pilot Project (Experimental Phase).

FP/0900-73-03(474) - Development and Operation of IRS Programme Activity Centre (Implementation Phase II) and FP/3104-79-01(249) - INFOTERRA Programme Activity Centre (Operational and Evaluation Phase).

The present project does not change the primary operations or functional responsibilities of INFOTERRA/PAC other than as required by the Governing Council as part of the evolution, development and improvement of the system. The most significant evolution, for the purpose of this evaluation, is an increasing emphasis on the provision by the INFOTERRA system of substantive information, including primary sources, rather than referral services alone. This is being accomplished at the national level by linking INFOTERRA national focal points with the existing information supply facilities within countries to form the nuclei of national environmental information systems with INFOTERRA as the core activity. At the international level, INFOTERRA/PAC operates a network of Special Sectoral Sources whose main function is to provide substantive information in areas of priority concern. Specialized directories and bibliographies complete this system for providing information.

The present evaluation examines one of the specialized INFOTERRA publications that contains information sources and a bibliography on climate issues. The publication, which was issued in December 1987, was distributed to 200 readers, together with a questionnaire. The results of the questionnaires are here below. Nineteen responses were received.

III. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

1. Profile of the readers

Half of the respondents were from developing countries, 28 per cent from developed countries and 22 per cent from international organizations. As regards the professional occupation of the respondents, 46 per cent were in information departments or libraries, 27 per cent were INFOTERRA focal points, and a further 47 per cent were in professional departments dealing with science, planning and management.

All the respondents indicated that their copy had been received directly from UNEP. Seventy-eight per cent indicated that their copy would also be made available to others, ranging from 8 to about 200 people. This is a usage good rate for the report.

2. Assessment of the quality of the report

In respect of the amount and type of information presented by the report, 70 per cent considered it to be very good, 16 per cent adequate and 6 per cent considered it poor. In fact, some pointed observations were made to the effect that the overall content of the report was rather poor and that not enough sources from developing countries were presented, although many

/...

existed. (Note: It should be remembered that the publication in question is not a report, but a directory of institutions registered by Governments as INFOTERRA sources suitable for international information exchange. All registered sources dealing with the subject of the publication were included. If there are other, better institutions, especially in developing countries, UNEP looks to Governments to enlist them as INFOTERRA sources. Unlike the commercially published directories, INFOTERRA directories list only those institutions which have formally agreed to participate in the INFOTERRA network and provide information on request. UNEP depends on government-designated INFOTERRA national focal points in participating countries to identify and select such institutions). Concerning the topicality of the information, 56 per cent considered it to be high, 33 per cent stated that it was adequate and 11 per cent considered it poor. In fact, one international organization strongly stated that a considerable amount of the information was quite out of date. Concerning the readability of the report, opinions were evenly divided, rating it either very good or adequate. As to the organization of the report, 56 per cent considered it very good, while the rest considered it adequate. Opinions on the presentation of the report were evenly divided between very good and adequate.

3. Usefulness of the report

In terms of the overall usefulness of the report in the work of the respondents, 63 per cent stated that it would be very useful and 38 per cent stated that it would be useful in part. Elaborating on this point, 38 per cent stated that it would be of high technical and substantive value while to them, while 56 per cent stated that it would be only of moderate value; the rest stated that it would be of little or no value from the technical and substantive point of view. Three quarters of the respondents said that the contents of the report were highly relevant to their work, while the remainder said that perhaps only half of the material was relevant to them. Twelve per cent stated that very little of the material was new to them, the balance being evenly divided between those who said that most or half of the material was new to them. Fifty-six per cent said that most of the information contained in the report would be used by them directly and 38 per cent said that about half of the material would be used.

It should be noted that the value of the material depends heavily on the willingness of the listed organizations to provide information, and one of the respondents stated doubts about such willingness. Most of the respondents stated that the material would be used in providing information on the subject to users of their information or referral services, while others said that it would be used either for research or for developing programmes and projects on technical issues.

4. Suggestions for improvement

Several useful suggestions were made, including a proposal that the system be made available on the computer diskettes or on on-line computer, which would make the material more easily accessible and more amenable to updating. (Note: the system is already available in these modes). In this connection, several respondents stated that the bibliography should be more up-to-date and that there should be an indication of where the documents cited in the bibliography could be found. It was also suggested that thematic bibliographies might be developed and that a more specialized treatment would give greater value to the report. Finally, several of the respondents suggested that the usefulness of the report would be greatly increased if more information on developing countries were included.

IV. MEETING OF THE PROJECT OBJECTIVES

In respect of meeting short-term objectives, no specific mention was made in the project document concerning the specialized directories. The long-term objective on the other hand, is relevant, and being a continuing process, is not a precise point to be reached. It can be said that the publications are contributing to the attainment of both objectives, through the provision of relevant information to decision makers. However, no information is available as to whether this information is leading to better decision-making.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

From the sample of questionnaires viewed, one can conclude that the report has been well received and is proving useful. Some shortcomings, however, are apparent including the lack of information on developing countries and the fact that the information contained in the bibliography could be more comprehensive and up-to-date.

It is recommended that UNEP use media that are more amenable to quick up-dating, such as computer-based information, alongside the "hard copy". More efforts should also be made to include information on developing countries.

Project Manager's Evaluation

Title: JOURNALISTIC ATTACHMENT PROGRAMME (JAP)
FP/3103-86-01 (2650)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Internal

Scope: Global

Duration: April 1986 - December 1987

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	142,673	100
Total	142,673	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) Increased media coverage of environmental issues;

(ii) Increased co-operation between UNEP and the mass media in promoting public awareness of concern for the environment; reinforcement of the capacity for environmental coverage of a select group of environmentally-concerned journalists.

Long-term objectives

(i) Establishment by 1990, of a network of 100-150 journalists, well-briefed by UNEP and highly motivated to cover environmental issues, and in so doing, to link their stories to UNEP's role and activities wherever possible;

(ii) Expansion of public recognition of UNEP's catalytic role as the global organization responsible for the environment.

Anticipated and actual outputs

(i) Worldwide increase of articles/radio programmes on topical environmental issues and UNEP's role and activities in important media. This has been achieved;

(ii) Feedback of articles/radio programmes to UNEP Information Service. Establishment of direct and on-going contacts between UNEP Information Service/Regional and Liaison Offices and participants and the Office of the Environment Programme. This has been achieved;

(iii) Thirty-two key journalists from all regions who will have received in-depth briefings on environmental issues and UNEP's role, as well as first-hand experience of important environmental issues that will enhance their ability to write on these issues. This output has been surpassed, as 50 journalists have been briefed;

/...

(iv) Visits of participating journalists to areas of Clearing-house activities will increase media coverage of Clearing-house efforts and needs. This has not been achieved, mainly because the activities undertaken so far under the Clearing-house do not lend themselves easily to media coverage.

Use of outputs

The outputs of the Journalistic Attachment Programme were used to promote public awareness of environmental issues, the work of the Office of the Environment Programme, and UNEP's role as the global organization responsible for the environment.

Selected articles/radio programmes have been produced in various United Nations languages and disseminated to Governments, NGOs and through the United Nations system.

A continuous supply of information on UNEP activities has been provided to the network of journalists.

The training received by the participants of the JAP Seminars has enabled them to become more effective media agents for promoting environmental issues. The trainees have produced a considerable number of articles and programmes which have reached millions. To give just a few examples, articles have appeared in the Japanese daily Yomiuri Shimbun, (circulation 8,000,000), and Redbook Magazine, (circulation 4,000,000). Radio programmes have also had a wide audience, for example Radio Cairo, with several million listeners in Egypt and neighbouring countries.

II. MEETING OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The short-term objectives of the project have been fulfilled, in that 50 journalists from various countries attended the seminars. In addition, there is a considerable amount of media coverage in newspapers, magazines, radio and TV that can be ascribed directly to the project.

The long-term objectives are on-going. It is clear that UNEP's role is being increasingly recognized by the media, and this can be ascribed in part to the project. The target for building a network of journalists has been set for 1990 and is being progressively reached.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has produced positive results and has been useful both in direct terms - through the training component - as well as in terms of catalysis, by producing unexpected spin-offs. A particularly significant example is that of the International Journalists' Symposium organized by a JAP participant, which provided millions of people with environmental information through a series of 10 articles on the front page of Yomiuri Shimbun one of the world's most influential newspapers, in Japan.

Among the recommendations that can be put forward for the improvement of the programme would be the expansion of the training component and the promotion of increased interaction between the media and UNEP.

/...

IV. SUMMARY OF SELECTED EVALUATIONS OF PROJECTS SUPPORTING NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

In-depth Evaluation

Title: INFORMATION SERVICES TO THE NGO COMMUNITY
FP/3103-84-03 (2489)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: Environment Liaison Centre, Nairobi, Kenya

Scope: Global

Duration: 1 April 1984 - June 1986

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To the Fund of UNEP	258,132	31
To ELC	584,450	69
Total	842,582	100

Objectives:

The project objectives did not differentiate between short-term objectives and long-term objectives.

(i) To provide an efficient information flow to the community of non-governmental organizations dealing with environmental and environment/development-related issues on subjects of particular concern to them;

(ii) To increase further the awareness of citizens' groups and, through them, the public at large, regarding issues that are of concern to UNEP and the United Nations system in the environmental field;

(iii) To promote a better understanding of UNEP's role within the NGO community, and to promote better-informed opinion on UNEP's programmes and activities;

(iv) To strengthen NGO capabilities in information dissemination and thus increase their efficiency as educators, awareness raisers, and initiators of action within their societies;

(v) To assist regional NGO activities through the provision of small grants.

II. BACKGROUND

UNEP began supporting the Environmental Liaison Centre (ELC) in 1977. Since then 16 projects were undertaken with ELC for a total commitment of $1,858,000 to the Fund of UNEP and, as at August 1987, a total expenditure of $1,461,000. As at August 1987, six projects were either ongoing or completed, but not yet closed.

/...

The project evaluated was to support ELC publications between April 1984 and June 1986, as well as providing small grants to needy NGOs.

From January 1984 to June 1986 the following outputs were produced:

Ecoforum: (Volume 9, numbers 1 to 6; Volume 10, numbers 1 to 6; Volume 11, issues 1 to 3).

Ecoforum is a 16-page bulletin that functions as a networking instrument for NGOs around the world to share information and strategies related to environment and sustainable development issues. Each issue is published bi-monthly in English, French and Spanish. The total print run increased from 5,000 copies in 1984 to 7,200 in the first half of 1986. The current mailing list includes 6,000 addresses, some of which receive more than one copy, and covers 64 countries. Requests for more copies either consume the entire print run or leave a maximum of 300 copies in stock. Of the total distribution, 370 are subscription copies, for which $30 is paid annually by international organizations, some NGOs from industrialized countries and individuals.

Ecoforum issues are theme-oriented, carrying (i) analytical articles and (ii) a review of NGO activities on the theme. Each issue also has a section of information on selected activities of UNEP, which, in addition, highlights emerging environmental issues of concern to UNEP and the United Nations system, such as global warming. The section in Ecoforum devoted to UNEP has explained some programmes or projects of UNEP, albeit not a holistic picture. This could be improved.

News Alert: (Volume 1, issues 1 to 5; Volume 2, issues 1 to 5; Volume 3, issues 1 to 2).

News Alert is a 4-page leaflet that presents news to NGOs on current or planned activities of environmental concern to them. Each issue is published in English, French and Spanish languages as a supplement to Ecoforum.

News Alert presented current news to NGOs concerned with environment and development issues, particularly information on current or planned NGO activities.

Both Ecoforum and News Alert have carried timely articles on major issues of public concern. However, in some cases, the quality of the articles was mediocre. The problem seemed to be editorial.

How to Papers: "Safe Pest Control" and "Conservation of Species and Genetic Resources".

These are guidelines for action by NGOs at the national and local levels. Each paper was published in English only in 1,000 copies because of financial constraints, each was distributed to selected developing countries NGOs active in the two topics.

Small Grants: A total of 18 NGOs were granted small sums of money totalling $30,000 to assist regional NGO activities.

II. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

A. ECOFORUM AND NEWS ALERT

1. Replies to Questionnaires

A questionnaire was prepared to evaluate, inter alia, the content and usefulness of Ecoforum to its readers. The questionnaire was sent out with Ecoforum Vol. 10, No. 4 in August 1985. About 360 NGOs replied to Part V of the questionnaire. This represents a return of 5.1 per cent, which is higher than standard return of UNEP questionnaires. The following are the results of the questionnaire assessed in September 1987: Asked if they had received publications or communications from ELC, responses were: 73 per cent yes and 27 per cent no. Of those answering yes, 70 per cent indicated that Ecoforum was the main communication link, while 30 per cent mentioned letters and other correspondence. By a large margin NGOs selected Ecoforum as the most important service provided by ELC. Those who assessed ELC's benefits to their organization gave the following ratings: 57 per cent Good; 28 per cent Moderate; 25 per cent Insufficient; 4 per cent Useless; 1 per cent Irrelevant. Of the 85 per cent who chose to answer the question "Have you ever come across/received any publication/communication from UNEP? " 70 per cent stated that they had.

2. Feedback from NGOs

Any one issue approximately, generates 75 to 150 letters from its readers. As there is no figure for the total readership, but only for the total number of copies distributed (about 7,000 per issue) the "rate of return" can be compared only with the distribution. The rate is between 1 per cent and 2 per cent. This can be considered a good response, even if it is compared to Time magazine that sells about 4,000,000 copies a year and receives about 100,000 letters a year with a "rate of return" of about 2.5 per cent of the total sales. Most of the letters are complimentary, either requesting more information, or giving views or requesting more copies of Ecoforum.

3. Reprinting of Ecoforum articles

There is ample evidence of reprints of Ecoforum articles by various journals, magazines and books. As reproduction of articles is encouraged and no permission is required, it is difficult to count the number of reprints.

4. Unsolicited material

An average of 10 unsolicited feature articles are received by ELC each month for inclusion in Ecoforum. Thirty-five books on average are received for review in Ecoforum every month. An average of 75 requests for press releases, conference announcements and news items from NGOs are received monthly by ELC for inclusion in Ecoforum. ELC receives an average of five offers per issue to write feature articles for Ecoforum.

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

On the basis of a review of several issues of Ecoforum, the questionnaire results, the feed-back from NGOs, reprinting of articles and unsolicited material received by ELC, it can be concluded that Ecoforum serves a felt need of the NGO community, i.e. information exchange. It has provided a good information flow to environment and development NGOs on subjects of practical concern to them, as well as having fostered an exchange of information between them. However, there is a need to improve some of the articles in terms of editing. If this shortcoming is remedied, Ecoforum should continue to be published.

In the past, most issues of News Alert were distributed together with Ecoforum. Consequently, no real sense of urgency was conveyed and the information carried by News Alert could have been printed in Ecoforum itself. This, coupled with financial constraints, caused UNEP rightly to stop funding the bulletin. However, careful consideration should be given to some mechanism to communicate truly urgent news to NGOs.

B. How to Papers

1. Status of requests

Demand for the two publications "Safe Pest Control" and "Conservation of Species and Genetic Resources" have outstripped the supply, particularly for the guidelines on safe pest control. The first 1,000 copies having been exhausted, ELC is now satisfying requests by sending photocopies. While there is ample evidence of requests for these guidelines in the ELC files, the evaluator could not determine whether the guidelines lead to any action by NGOs.

2. Conclusions and Recommendations

Although the impact of the guidelines cannot be assessed, the requests are a good indicator of their popularity among NGOs. Thought should be given to translating them in French, as Francophone NGOs have yet to benefit from them.

C. Small Grants

1. Status of grants

The Small Grants given to NGOs were for 18 action oriented projects with a multiplier effect and community participation. For example:

In Turkey, the Environmental Problems of Turkey Foundation published, with a grant of $1,200, the first environmental book in Turkish. In India, the Society of Naturalists (INSONA) conducted a nation-wide campaign on the theme "Save our Biosphere". With a grant of $500, they published a set of four campaign cards on the subject, each featuring an endangered wild animal species. In Kenya, with only US$195, Mbugiti Secondary School (a member of the Wildlife Clubs of Kenya) established a tree nursery of 200,000 seedlings to be given to parents and other members of the local community. In Equador, Fundacion Natura organized an environmental education conference for Latin America funded partly by a $5,000 grant.

/...

Follow-up by ELC to the small grants given was limited to asking for and reviewing final reports from NGOs who received these sums.

2. Conclusions and Recommendations

Providing small grants to NGOs is a very cost-effective mechanism to promote environment and development concept at the grass-roots level. As long as overhead costs are low, it should continue. ELC should try to follow-up more vigorously to see whether these small grants have had the desired impact, rather than ensuring only that the activities for which the grant was intended were carried out.

D. General cost-effectiveness of the project

1. Analysis

A very simple analysis of the project costs was done.

The costs of the How to Papers and Small Grants were deducted from the total cost of the project and the remaining balance was divided by the number of Ecoforum/News Alert copies distributed during the biennium. This analysis revealed that the cost per copy would have been $9, which is far too high.

Discussions with ELC revealed that the real cost of the production, translation and distribution of Ecoforum/News alert is about $2.2 per copy. The reason why the analysis of the costs revealed a much higher figure was that ELC had included their total operating costs in the budget. Hence, the project outputs were not commensurate with the total cost of the project.

2. Conclusions and Recommendations

The project costs to ELC were unrealistically high as to make the project appear highly cost-ineffective, while this was not in fact the case. It is imperative that before project approval, a simple analysis be made each time to see whether the project outputs are commensurate with the costs.

III. MEETING OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES

A good information flow to the NGO community that deals with environment and development was achieved through this project. This, in turn, coupled with the Small Grants, served to strengthen NGO capabilities as disseminators of information. Therefore objectives (i), (iv) and (v) can be considered met. A better understanding by NGOs of UNEP was achieved at least to the extent that in 1985/1986 UNEP was known to 70 per cent of the 6,000 NGOs on ELC mailing list (extrapolation from questionnaire results). Therefore objective (iii) can be considered partially met.

The extent to which objective (ii) might have been achieved could not be assessed.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In addition to the specific conclusions and recommendations pertaining to each output, the Evaluation Review Committee concluded that UNEP needed to prepare a well-determined strategy of how best to make use of NGOs to further its aims and obtain a multiplier effect. Once a strategy is set out, all on-going and planned NGO projects should be tailored to it.

Further, the Committee concluded that ELC should be encouraged to do more for the money they receive.

Project Manager's Evaluation

Title: SUPPORT TO THE AFRICAN NGO NETWORK TO COMBAT DESERTIFICATION: ENVIRONMENTAL REHABILITATION OF FOUR VILLAGES IN KWENENG DISTRICT, BOTSWANA - FP/6201-86-02 (2640)

I. PROJECT DATA

Implementation: African NGO Environment Network (ANEN)

Scope: Africa

Duration: June 1986 - March 1990

Cost:

	Expressed in US$	%
To UNEP	201,981	62
To ANEN	127,000	38
Total	328,981	100

Objectives:

Short-term objectives

(i) To strengthen ANEN's capacity to co-ordinate the African NGO network in desertification control activities, both at national and regional levels;

(ii) To help to identify and support field projects to be undertaken by African NGOs aimed at the establishment of village forest resources and the construction of soil and water conservation works;

(iii) To contribute through the support of these field projects to self-sufficiency in food and energy of 150 villages in Africa, as envisaged under the Cairo Programme for African Co-operation;

(iv) To contribute to the promotion of the exchange and dissemination of information and experience among NGOs involved in combating desertification in Africa.

Long-term objectives

(i) To reinforce the African NGO network in order to enhance the capabilities of its members to contribute towards halting the process of desertification;

(ii) To contribute to the creation of public awareness and the intensification of popular participation in national programmes addressed to problems of environmental degradation.

/...

Objectives specific to the sub-project

(i) To strengthen the capability of Kweneng Rural Development Association in desertification control activities in Kweneng District in Botswana;

(ii) To help land conservation, regeneration of vegetable cover and better rehabilitation of the ruined environment.

Background

In 1982, during the NGO Symposium entitled "Environment and the Future" sponsored by the Environment Liaison Centre (ELC) in Nairobi, the 21 participating organizations decided to set up the African NGO's Environment Network (ANEN) so as to deal in a practical manner with the environmental problems affecting Africa.

ANEN was defined as being a regional, grass-roots organization whose main task was to promote and strengthen communications and co-operation between the NGOs and their Governments; provide sound leadership among environment and development NGOs; and facilitate active participation of NGOs in environment and development projects.

The First African Ministerial Conference on the Environment (AMCEN), held in Cairo from 16-18 December 1985, adopted a resolution in which it called for action to address the complex problems of grass-roots development, through the implementation of pilot projects in 150 villages in Africa with a view to assisting them to become self-sufficient in food and energy.

To assist in the implementation of this resolution, UNEP decided to set up the present project to help selected NGOs to carry out field projects in certain villages to address food and energy problems.

A series of such projects have already been carried out within the ANEN framework. Below is the evaluation of one of these projects carried out in Botswana. The main local body responsible for the project is the Kweneng Rural Development Association (KRDA). The project was carried out from May 1987 to September 1988.

Anticipated and actual outputs

(i) Approximately 160,000 trees planted:

This output has fallen short of what was planned, but if work progresses as it has in the recent past, the goal is likely to be reached;

(ii) Reafforestation carried out in the four villages (the total area being 600 ha; 150 ha in each village):

This has not been achieved fully, as it is a factor of seedling production and tree planting;

(iii) Production of approximately 160,000 seedlings; 50,000 in each village:

Total seedling production for 1988 was 15,000, similar to that of 1987. Thus, although the target has not been reached fully, the situation is promising;

(iv) Creation of approximately 40 labourers' jobs:

No precise information is available, but the seedling production and afforestation activities have generated jobs. KRDA employs approximately 20 people in the forestry unit;

(v) The land will be fixed and there will be less wind erosion and better production of cultivated areas:

This has not yet been achieved, as it is a function of the afforestation process.

Use of outputs

(i) The seedlings have been used for KRDA's own commercial plantations; research, for increasing awareness through National Tree Planting Days and school plantations; landscaping of villages; sale of fruit or ornamental trees to individuals; desertification control through construction of windbreaks and gully reclamation;

(ii) Plantations have been used to provide timber for construction material and firewood (free collection of branches and harvest left-overs by local people and sales of chopped firewood to town people). They have also served as research sites;

(iii) The KRDA Forestry Unit has created jobs and trained local people in forestry routines (logging, maintenance, nursery activities);

(iv) The greenhouse provides protection for young seedlings against frost.

Meeting of short-term objectives

The specific objectives of the project in Botswana have been only partially met, and with hindsight, it is clear that they were overambitious. In spite of this, the work of the KRDA has been positive and has contributed to land conservation and rehabilitation.

Meeting of the broader objectives concerning the overall ANEW project have not been met, as the Government of Botswana has not yet implemented the recommendations of the Cairo Programme.

Prospects for achieving the long-term objectives

The prospects are good, as the achievements of the project in Botswana are a positive contribution to enhancing both local capabilities and the halting of the process of desertification.

/...

UNEP's inputs to the project

The main input from UNEP has been financial, amounting to US$25,000. Technical inputs have not been very visible. The catalytic role of UNEP has perhaps not been very great, in particular if one considers that its involvement in the project came at a late stage, after other organizations and donors had been active for some time. It should also be noted that the KRDA has already operated for 15 years.

Lessons learnt from the project

Important technical lessons have been learnt as regards the choice of species - particularly that Eucalyptus planting should be de-emphasized. The importance of well-trained staff has been shown to be essential to success of projects of this nature. Finally, it is clear that the uneven funding of projects, such as has been the case in the present project, prevents the making of long-term plans.

As for UNEP's participation in the project, it is doubtful whether such ad hoc support is within its mandate, or really exerts a catalytic and co-ordinating role.

Recommendations

Various specific recommendations can be made, apart from concluding that UNEP terminate its outstanding support to the project without further delays:

(i) To study the energy use of villages more carefully;

(ii) To endeavour to place the project activities or similar ones within the Cairo Programme framework. KRDA is a good institutional framework for these actions.